

**SUBMITTAL TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

880



FROM: Purchasing/Fleet Services Department
Waste Management Department

SUBMITTAL DATE:
September 16, 2005


SUBJECT: Low Ground Pressure (LGP) Crawler Tractor

RECOMMENDED MOTION: The Board approve the purchase of a 2005, Low Ground Pressure (LGP), Crawler Tractor for the Waste Management Department, from the most responsive bidder, RDO Equipment Company, in the amount of \$323,218.18.

BACKGROUND: On May 19, 2005 the Department of Purchasing and Fleet Services under the direction of the County of Riverside, Waste Management Department, advertised a Request for Quotation (RFQ) #PUARC-00687 to procure a 2005 model, 180-HP Turbo-Diesel, Low Ground Pressure (LGP) Crawler Tractor. The solicitation was sent to four vendors and advertised on the Internet where it was viewed ten times and downloaded four times. The solicitation closed on June 10, 2005 and two responses were received: Johnson Machinery Company for a model D6R LGP, Caterpillar Crawler Tractor in the amount of \$315,372.12 and RDO Equipment Company for a John Deere model #850-J in the amount of \$323,218.18. While the Waste Management Department owns and operates other Caterpillar tractors, the bid from Johnson Machinery Company did not meet several important operational requirements stated in the RFQ specifications. (Continued)

Departmental Concurrence



Robert Howdysshell, Director
Purchasing and Fleet Services Department


Hans W. Kernkamp, General Manager-Chief Engineer
Waste Management Department

FINANCIAL DATA	Current F.Y. Total Cost:	\$ 323,218.18	In Current Year Budget:	YES
	Current F.Y. Net County Cost:	\$ 0	Budget Adjustment:	NO
	Annual Net County Cost:	\$ 0	For Fiscal Year:	05/06

SOURCE OF FUNDS: Waste Management Enterprise Fund	Positions To Be Deleted Per A-30	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Requires 4/5 Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>

C.E.O. RECOMMENDATION: **APPROVE**

County Executive Office Signature 

Policy

Consent

Dept's Recomm.:
Per Exec. Ofc.:

Prev. Agn. Ref.: NONE | **District:** All | **Agenda Number:**

12.1

FORM APPROVED
COUNTY COUNSEL

SEP 19 2005

Allison

3002 26-51 2011: 12
COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE

The John Deere tractor will better meet the landfill operation needs of the Waste Management Department for the intended specialized work. Johnson Machinery Company has protested this award. Staff from the Waste Management and Purchasing Departments has met with representatives of Johnson and neither has been able to adequately satisfy Johnson Machinery Company's concerns.

The Waste Management Department currently utilizes a Caterpillar D6R tractor purchased from Johnson Machinery Company in 2002 for the Badlands landfill and is aware of the handling characteristics and maintenance requirements of that tractor in a landfill environment. Staff has also had the opportunity to operate other similar crawler tractors with hydrostatic transmission in the past (manufactured by Case and also by John Deere). After three years of operation of the Caterpillar D6R LGP and past operation experience with other vendor equipment, staff firmly believes the John Deere 850J is the better choice for the Waste Management Department's landfill operations for the following reasons:

Safety

Although both the CAT D6R LGP and the John Deere 850J machine stop whenever the decelerator is depressed to the end of travel (or whenever the brake pedal is depressed), the John Deere's hydrostatic (dynamic) braking also stops the machine whenever the direction-control lever is moved to neutral. This is important for traveling down a slope; the operator of a John Deere 850J can place the machine in neutral and the machine will automatically stop. On the other hand, placing the D6R in neutral while traveling down a slope will cause the D6R to freewheel and will require additional brake application to keep the machine from accelerating down the slope. The John Deere machine will therefore create a safer working environment while working on steep slopes, as it immediately prevents the operator from performing unanticipated turning or braking during emergency conditions, a critical concern while pushing protective soil cover material upslope on liners and other finish work around the landfill site.

Johnson Machinery believes their proposed alternative to the hydrostatic transmission specified in the RFQ results in a better life expectancy of the equipment, which in this case is less important to the Waste Management Department. Safety is a critical factor in the Waste Management Department's selection process. In addition, the tractor's intended use is *careful placement of material* upon multi-million dollar landfill liners not moving large quantities of material quickly. That is more important than the lesser wear and tear expected with typical use of the D6R machine.

Work Production

Only the John Deere has the decelerator switch specified in the RFQ which allows the operator full power when slowing the machine for finish work, winching, or other low-speed duties. The John Deere 850J can push a load of dirt up a steep slope very slowly without losing full power. On the contrary, the D6R will not have full power while traveling at slow speeds unless the D6R increases its RPM's. Increasing the RPM's will cause the D6R to increase speed, which will require that the operator simultaneously apply the brakes to keep the machine at a constant slow speed; and this causes the operator to concentrate on additional tasks simultaneously.

Although Johnson Machinery Company/Caterpillar produces smaller dozers (D3G, D4G, and D5G) that are primarily for finish work and come with a hydrostatic transmission, only John Deere provides a hydrostatic transmission in a larger dozer. The John Deere 850J and its hydrostatic transmission is the better choice because this machine will primarily be used to place protective soil on landfill liner and other finish work around the landfill site, while still providing the comparable horse power of a Caterpillar D6R LGP.

Placement of protective cover on the Department's investment in multi-million dollar liner systems is a very delicate task that is required by the regulatory agencies to be observed at all times. Any damage to the liner results in expensive repairs, along with time delays. The ability of the John Deere 850J to operate very slowly at full power allows for safer and easier application to minimize liner damage and the associated delays and repair costs.

It is both Departments' request that the Board approve the award to RDO Equipment Company for a John Deere model #850-J Crawler Tractor.