MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA



9.31

During the oral communication section of the agenda for Tuesday, June 8, 2010, Rebecca Ludwig spoke regarding an issue at Eddie Smith Senior Center.

ATTACHMENTS FILED WITH CLERK OF THE BOARD

May 2, 2010

Jan Janes

my

Housing Authority Attention: Pat Buckey, Administrative Services Supervisor 5555 Arlington Avenue Riverside, CA 92504

Subject: Responding to your letter dated April 27, 2010, Regarding the Eddie Smith Senior Center

Dear Pat Buckey,

Once again, I would like to take this opportunity to sincerely express my appreciation to Donna Johnston, Heidi Marshall and you Pat Buckey for your "sincere efforts" in trying to "correct" reported "abusive behavior" at the Eddie Smith Senior Center.

In reviewing my documentation, it exceeded the amount you have listed at twenty, this included letters, emails, meetings and telephone conversations, in which I conveyed my complaint honestly and with factual accuracy. However, I am not surprised at the outcome after receiving your letter and its transparency is obviously adhering to a higher authority. Ladies, I have talked and met with you; call it intuition, but this letter has an overtone that no longer represents the women I met. Therefore, I can only conclude that your boss Supervisor John Tavaglione got involved and felt it was more important to expedite closure by having you construct this letter for the sole purpose of doing "Political Damage Control" because he is seeking re-election! The letter is now down playing the issues by making it seem unimportant and attempting to make unfounded allegations; claiming that you recently received letters, stating that I even tried to recruit seniors and talked about Bob Craig with contempt.

In our first meeting you listen to my complaint and viewed it with creditability and made sincere efforts in trying to correct the situation. You were also informed that I did not talk or socialize with 95% of the seniors at the Center and that I was never disrespectful towards Bob. That I had made a choice to stop communicating with him because of his refusal to listen and did not appreciate his abusive demeanor when talking to me (if my children are not allowed to treat me with disrespect by should Bob Craig or anyone else for that matter). There has never been any intent of malice, or I would have reported him immediately, instead of enduring a year of being bullied, harassed and stalked, hoping he would stop. However, his behavior became increasingly abusive and finally found it necessary to report him. Ladies, you all know that I realized the seriousness of my complaint and that my primary focus has always been to find a resolution that would be conductive for both parties.

-8-10 Item ORAL

(date)

Be assured that I am capable of handling my own affairs and would never sabotage what I was trying to accomplish. That is why I went to you in the first place!

Please give special attention to the dates listed below in order to recognize questionable actions taken and why I am calling this "Political Damage Control".

- 1. On February 15, 2010, I mailed a third letter to the Housing Authority with a list of individuals who witnessed and wanted to come forward to confirm what was taking place at the Eddie Smith Senior. I even sent an email, advising that they were wondering why they had never been notified. Yet, recently you received letters from seniors and are able to give these letters merit! This is a little one sided! This is exactly when Political Damage Control went into affect;
- 2. On February 23, 2010, I spoke before the Board of Supervisors and provided copies of my three letters, hoping to resolve my ordeal and to make it a matter of public record;
- 3. In the first week of March, 2010, an award was given for Woman of the Year in Sacramento to Lynn Craig. Ordinarily, this would not be a concern, but everyone had prior knowledge regarding serious abusive behavior at the Eddie Smith Senior Center, which was reported before my call on September 30, 2008. Keep in mind that Bob and Lynn Craig combined only work a total of 40 hours a week. I personally know men and women who volunteer 60 to 80 hours a week to make a difference in our Community;
- 4. On April 1, 2010, Bob and Lynn Craig received a Proclamation for their outstanding service from the Department of Aging and Donna Johnston. This was done at noon when they would have a captive audience, but many viewed it as political and undeserving;
- 5. On April 6, 2010, I spoke before the Board of Supervisors again, attempting to report on other incidents that had taken place at the Center and questioned the motives behind these awards and to also make this a matter of public record;
- 6. On April 7, 2010, a survey was conducted without sufficient notification and only in English. Please note: that food share day has approximately 100 to 300 at the Center. This does not represent accurate attendance, but once again there was a captive audience. Some were willing to fill out the survey others did not understand it and many felt it wouldn't matter. I personally heard Yvonne campaigning to get as much recognition as possible making the survey a joke! Here is an "employee that doesn't even work from 7:30 a.m. to 3:00 p.m. five days a week" but does manage get her name mentioned the most on the survey. However, she is responsible for causing 20% of the

drama, gossip and false allegations at the Center. The survey was vague and could have been worded differently if you "really" wanted to obtain the necessary information concerning problems on a daily bases. Instead, you went around the problems;

- 7. On April 28, 2010, I received a letter via email from you Pat Buckey dated April 27, 2010, advising that the first Town Hall Meeting would be taking place on April 29, 2010 and once again, was lacking sufficient notification. But, did manage to get a captive audience again. It was reported that 195 surveys were turn in and that it showed a 92% approval rating for the Senior Center. I personally had a problem with this assessment, because there are over 700 seniors who attend the center on food box day and the majority is minorities. I can assure you that your approval rating would drop dramatically, especially if someone was available to explain the importance of the survey by asking what improvements they would like done or what they disapprove of that relates to the Center and its employees;
- 8. It was stated that a person would be coming into the Center three hours daily to be of assistance for minorities and to date no one has shown up. I did notice that a few individuals tried to shoot down this idea, while some employees and seniors suspected that this person would only be a spy at the Center. Please note: that many minorities are keeping a low profile these days, because of the immigration situation and seniors who display a lack of consideration in vocalizing their dislike against minorities; limiting their visits to the Center for food distribution only;
- 9. The Customer Satisfaction Questionnaire clearly states that I am not the "only person" who has had a bad experience with Bob Craig. So we can now put one rumor to rest! As for Rae who does work from 7:30 a.m. to 3:00 p.m. five days a week and can still manage to extend "common courtesies" to everyone is amazing to me, based on what I have witnessed. She and the majority of the volunteers work extremely hard to keep things going at the Center and are truly worthy of special recognition;
- 10. After April 6, 2010, someone started blacking out the Board of Supervisors Meetings that are televised on the Public Access Channel, which I brought to Donna Johnston attention. In the future kindly refrain from doing this especially during election time!

Through this process I discovered four things that were equally disturbing:

- 1. Politicians keep making the assumption that if you live in low income areas your intelligence is diminished.
- 2. Agencies like the Housing Authority, Department of Aging, Fire and Sheriff's etc. in District #2 are ultimately controlled by Supervisor Tavaglione.

- 3. If you have a complaint that occurred in the Corporate area and live in the Unincorporated area, it is virtually impossible to find anyone who will be able to assist you. Why? Because the Corporate area is under the jurisdiction of City Council. The Unincorporated area is under the Board of Supervisors. The system is designed to frustrate individuals so that you give up and therefore; the problem will be eliminated. In disbelief, but not surprising a Government Employee told me to move to the Corporate part of Riverside in order to get better results.
- 4. How can Supervisor Tavaglione get emotional over completion of a concrete building and do political damage control on reported senior abuse right next door? What is the purpose for the outward appearance of a location, when its core is being neglected? For example: I attended the opening of the Library and spoke with parents of two children, who felt that the money could have been better spent towards their children's education and safety. The current risk factors are being compounded by continuing to allow pedophiles into the Unincorporated area, because the restriction requirements are not as stringent as for Corporate areas in Riverside. Even Supervisor Tavaglione's re-election flyer has distorted information and I strongly suggest that he live in District #2 for one month to get a better perspective on what residents really need.

In my opinion, Supervisor Tavaglione is only concerned with self interest groups that can elect him into office year after year and chooses to do Political Damage Control when a situation becomes problematic. I am now questioning his leadership abilities and motives as a Supervisor. I may be only one resident, but with all due respect....your boss has lost my vote!

I thought long and hard before making that first telephone call and its ramifications, not only for Bob and Yvonne, but for me as well. After Heidi Marshall talked with Bob, about two months later information started leaking out at the Center and it did not come from me. Seniors who never talked to me before were now approaching me (BIG RED FLAG). Many viewed me as the problem, one just wanted more information on how I reported my complaint, some felt I was doing the right thing, but didn't have the nerve to speak up, some stop coming to the Center because of the way they were treated and wanted me to be their crusader. I told some of these individuals that it might be wise not to be seen talking with me, because the rumors were getting so vicious and they could be the next target. How vicious? Vicious enough for someone to stab a blade though the side of my front right tire on April 24, 2010, between midnight and three in the morning. I don't even know 95% of my neighbor's, the apartment complex and I have never had anything like this happen before. There were so many rumors I finally had to do some damage control of my own, so I gave copies of my letters to three of the biggest gossips at the Center, for the sole purpose of putting these rumors to rest and stop their ridiculous assumptions. I am even willing to take a polygraph. Kindly, ask your recent letter writers if they are willing to do the same, if so....I will pay for it?

When I go to the Center it is to get out of my apartment for a few hours and work on puzzles, which is a form of therapy, so I don't dwell on losing family members and medical concerns. For months this was going along fairly well until Yvonne was finally caught trying to disturb this simple pleasure that I enjoyed at the Center. Her act was so petty that a senior felt compelled to speak up on my behalf and informed me about it. The good new is that I had a meeting with Bob, Lynn and Rae and this has now been put to rest hopefully. As for the incidents on March 17th and 18th you were advised that I could not discuss this matter with you, because I gave my word to Senator Barbara Boxer's Office to wait until they had a chance to review my information and send a letter to Supervisor Tavaglione.

We are approaching three years and what has happened is totally absurd! The first year I endured abusive behavior because of my refusal to communicate with the abuser. Second year tolerated rumors, speculation and pettiness from individuals that interfered with matters that did not concern them. Third year was under estimated and then victimized by a system that was intended to help. However, regardless of what you may think, it was important to me in defending my dignity and protecting my self-respect against anyone. I am a survivor and my refusal to become a victim should serve as a Testimonial about the type of person I am and have no regrets!

Sincerely,

Rebecca Ludwig

951-784-0112

Enclosure

Cc: Supervisor John Tavaglione

Donna Johnston, Senior Legislative Assistant

Heidi Marshall, Director of Housing Authority

Board of Supervisors - Riverside

Office of the Governor - Riverside

Senator Barbara Boxer

Calvin Jefferies, District #66

Robert Dunnon District #31

Dan Horn, President/Owner - Palm Desert Development Company



HOUSING AUTHORITY of the County of Riverside

Main Office 5555 Arlington Avenue Riverside, CA 92504-2506 (951) 351-0700 Admin FAX (951) 688-6873 Housing FAX 951.354-6324 TDD (951) 351-9844

April 27, 2010

Rebecca Ludwig 5875 Mission Blvd, Unit K-156 Riverside, CA 92509 Indio Office 44-199 Monroe, Suite B P.O. Box 1747 Indio, CA 92201-1747 (760) 863-2828 (760) 863-2838 FAX TDD (760) 863-2830

Website:harivco.org

Dear Ms. Ludwig:

Thank you for taking time to contact the Housing Authority to explain the issues that have occurred at the Eddie Dee Smith Senior Center (Senior Center). We regret any inconvenience you have experienced and are grateful for the opportunity to continue to provide you with the services that the Senior Center has to offer.

I have reviewed the information you have shared with us and have concluded my review of the matter.

The information I used during my review included the following:

- 1. phone call from you on September 30, 2008 during which you advise us of your experiences at the Center;
- 2. phone call from you on October 2, 2008 during which you advise us that you will be sending us a letter and reiterate that you do not wish to have Mr. Craig, one of the Directors of the Senior Center, communicate with you;
- 3. letter dated November 15, 2008 in which you again advise us of your experiences at the Center;
- 4. letter dated October 10, 2009 in which you again advise us of your experiences at the Center;
- 5. notes from our meeting on October 19, 2009 that took place at the Housing Authority;
- 6. phone call on October 27, 2009 providing us with an update on your visits to the Center; and also inquiring about what we had shared with Mr. Craig regarding our meeting:
- 7. phone call on November 24, 2009 advising us that the 'atmosphere at the Center had improved', and advising us of your discontent that Yvonne had interrupted your massage at the Center;
- 8. email dated December 7, 2009 advising us that Mr. Craig was leaving you alone, as you had requested, but that there were problems with the food distribution program;
- 9. email dated December 7, 2009 advising us that your 'primary objective was to just stop Bob from harassing me and so far he has and that is all I really wanted'.

You stated, however, that you were feeling uncomfortable when you visited the

Center but that you could 'handle it'.

10 correspondence dated February 15, 2010 advising us that you had noticed an improvement at the Center, but that you felt it was short-lived; you noted that Mr. Craig was no longer speaking to you; you stated that you would be providing us with contact information from 'other individuals who are willing to come forward and reveal what they witnessed or experienced while at the Eddie Smith Senior Center'.

11. notes from our meeting on February 16, 2010;

12.email dated February 18, 2010 which included two names of persons who you stated could 'verify to my integrity';

13. the notes you forwarded to us that included the comments you made before the

Board of Supervisors on February 23, 2010;

14.email from you dated February 23, 2010 forwarding a copy of the

correspondence you provided us on February 15, 2010;

15.a forwarded copy of the correspondence you sent to Donna Johnston on February 25, 2010 regarding your appreciation for the presence of Housing Authority staff at the Senior Center; the food distribution day; and the incidents at

the Mission Palm Apartments;

16. email from March 23, 2010 advising us of three new incidents that occurred on the 17th and 18th of the same month. We responded by asking you to provide us with information regarding the incidents, to which you responded that you could not. You also ask us to contact two character witnesses to which we respond by asking if these two individuals have first-hand knowledge regarding the Center and its services. Your response was that they are aware of the correspondence you have sent us. Your character is not at question and therefore we requested contact information from individuals who you stated were witnesses to the events you have described as occurring at the Senior Center.

17. email from March 24, 2010 updating us on the food distribution day;

18. the notes you forwarded to us that included the comments you made before the Board of Supervisors on April 6, 2010;

19 Your correspondence to Calvin Jefferies (Kevin Jeffries), 66th District dated April 21, 2010 in which you state that the only request that you have made was for someone to stop the harassment coming from Bob. You also mention a discussion by seniors regarding the survey that the Housing Authority conducted in April of 2010, mainly that it was done in English only; and that it was vague.

20 phone call and subsequent email from you on April 21, 2010 asking that another employee from the Center, Yvonne, also cease from communicating with you

directly.

As a result of the concerns you shared, we took it upon ourselves to determine the level of satisfaction of the services and programs of the Center amongst its clients. Toward this end, the Housing Authority conducted a customer satisfaction survey, using a standard survey tool used by our main office. We received 195 surveys in return. Based on the surveys received, we learned that there is a 92% approval rating (respondents felt the services were good or excellent) among the seniors who frequent the Senior Center. This helped in determining that the service delivery coming from the

Clients.

During this time, we also received several letters from individuals who have written to the Housing Authority advising us of your communication efforts with them, regarding your contempt for Mr. Craig. The seniors who wrote to us further complained about your efforts to recruit them and stated that they are uncomfortable when you advise them to complain to management when they have nothing to complain about. Their letters also expressed that the employees of the Center 'are doing a fantastic job.' You are to stop your efforts in this area as it is creating an uncomfortable setting for the seniors who frequent the Center.

Please be assured that we have analyzed the information presented to us and given it the attention it deserves. We have taken the necessary and appropriate action as we seek to not only satisfy your concerns but also because we want to continually improve the services that the Center provides. Along with gathering feedback regarding our services and programs, the surveys gave us some insight on how to improve on our service delivery; improve our customer service standards, and improve our methods of communication. We will soon be sharing our plans on how we will do this with the public during a Town Hall Meeting on Thursday, April 29, 2010 at 12 noon taking place at the Senior Center. You are invited to join us then.

Please note that we consider this matter as closed. We hope that we have addressed your concerns and wish you well.

Sincerely,

Heidi Marshall

Assistant Director, EDA/Housing Authority

cc: Supervisor John Tavaglione

Prounted at the Center on 4/7/10 by HOUSING AUTHORITY & DEPTOF

Rate the service you receive from the Eddie Dee Smith Senior Center:

Mission

The primary mission of the Eddie Dee Smith Senior Center is to serve older adults of the community and provide services, information, meals and activities geared to the needs of an older adult. Our goal is to create a safe and healthy environment that will enhance the quality of life of older adults through the collaborative efforts of the Senior Center leadership.

Customer Service

The Housing Authority of the County of Riverside oversees the operation of the Eddie Dee Smith Senior Center and is continuously seeking to improve its level of customer service. Please take a moment to complete this survey so that we may be assisted in providing you with the highest level of service. Your comments and concerns are important to us and we thank you for your assistance.

					0		4 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1		Completed surveys can be maned Housing Authority County of	Riverside	5555 Arlington Avenue	Attention: Pat Buckey	www.hariyco.org	T. Care Community United	Equal Opportunity mousing	4		-
Wait time to be assisted (in office/telephone):	□ Poor	Employees who are knowledgeable of Senior	:quirements: □ Fair	☐ Poor	Providing information and direction that is easy to		□ Fair	□ Poor	employees:	□ Fair	□ Poor	Ease of reaching a person who could help you:	□ Poor	A series of the information voll received:	□ Fair	□ Poor		□ Fair
ne to be assisted		yees who are kno	Center programs and requirements: Excellent Fair	□ Good	ding information an	understand:	☐ Excellent	□ Good	Courteous and friendly employees:	☐ Excellent	□ Good	of reaching a perso	□ G00d	was of the information	uracy or the milotime ☐ Excellent	Good	Overall performance:	☐ Excellent

;;

Eddie Dee Smith Senior Center Customer Satisfaction Questionnaires

Favorable Unfavorable	e Unfa	avorabl		No Response	ponse		2 1	e.					
95%		7%		1%									
	Total		Excellent	ent	Good	1	Fair		Poor	200	No Re	Poor · No Respons	
Waiting time to be assisted	197	100% 115 58%	115	28%	65	33%	16	16 8%	0	%0	1	1%	
Employees who are knowledgeable of Senior Center programs and requirements	197 S	100%	122	62%	. 62	31%	8	%8	ĸ	2%	0	%	
Providing info & direction that is easy to understand	197	100%	126	64%	53	27%	14	2%	4	7%	0	%0	
Courteous & friendly employees	197	100% 140 71% 42	140	71%	42	21% 8	00	4%	9	3%	н	1%	
Ease of reaching a person who could help you	p 197	100%	117	29%	63	32%	13	7%	H W	1%	က	7%	
Accuracy of info received	197	100%	120	61%	09	30%	15	%8	0	%	7	1%	
Overall performance	197	100% 131	131	%99	52	79%	10	2%	ო	7%	1	1%	
Total	197	197 100% 871 63% 397	871	63%	397	29% 86 6% 17 1%	98	%9	17	1%	∞	1%	

Comments:

with daily matters. Lawyer, other things that they need. Tax people - etc. Place is too small. Help with other things.
We are very satisfied of services that the employees give to us.
Everything is good.
What help can I get Home repairs, etc. This center great job. (Bob & Lynne)
Nice program especially right now in this economy.

Comments:

The things they do here are wonder, help with meals and extra food also do breakfast (\$3.00) very good. Lunch is good also. Summer they have games and snacks.	They are all very good if they don't know they will get someone to help you or get the answers for you.	Coming here for 22 years and enjoying every visit here. Always something going on of interest.	This is a God sent for us seniors to have a place like this to come to. Keep up the good work.	Many do not want to complain out of fear. I just heard a volunteer telling people to put good thing about her-shame! Rae & volunteers do a good job!
Everyone is always very helpful.	Good people, always helpful.	Sophia Matus, Bob, Ray good.	It is a privilege to be part of the center. Sophi Matus, Ray good.	What help can I get Home repairs, etc. This center great job. (Bob & Lynne)
Ray is top person there. People in kitchen good. Everybody there is helpful.	Sophia is so sweet and very helpful. I appreciate her a lot. Thank you for having her here to help us.	Very good service. Sophia has the answers.	Sophia and Ray are very good leaders for our center and Yvonne, lvy are all good at what they do.	The staff go out of their way to help seniors they are friendly - make you feel that you are an important person.
Excellent	Good, good, good	I like it very much	Everyone super nice	Real Good
Lynn & Bob Graig are always looking out for the seniors and their	I think Lynn & Bob do an excellent job at providing service to the seniors by	Started coming here when center 1st opened, they treat me better here than at home	Bob does a very good job with the seniors on food day. Sometimes this can be	The center and everyone makes a person feel very
needs and they always try very hard to please	everyone I know what's going on. As far as get	I'm "enchanted" with the service here.	hard to do with seniors not get in line right and then	so much. Thanks for letting me say how I feel.
everyone, we here at E. D. Center are very lucky to have Lynn & Bob.	togethers & trips to different places.		they do want more.	8
Enjoy all the help and accommodations at the center.	Very good service, nothing to complain.	Would like to have food distribution before the 1st of the month.	Ray & Bob are outstanding interactions at all times. Yvonne says me too!	Need more space for more activities for the increasing population.
Such a wonderful place to come to. Lynn & Bob do a great job. Also all of the volunteers are great!	This is the Senior Center that I feel at home: Everyone always has a smile.	Ms. Lynne and Sofia are very friendly with everyone they come into contact	Everyone who works here treats me very kindly, that's why I like it here so much	Sofia does really good work, she helps me out a lot even though I don't speak English. Rae and William also, they are good people
Yvonne she is a hard worker, friendly, courteous and lovable.	I'm satisfied with the services I receive here.	People are always angry here.	like the people here.	Yvonne & Ray very helpful in the office.
This is a wonderful Senior Center. Everyone is friendly and kind. A good place to come to.	Yvonne is a wonderful and polite person. You are lucky to have her.	People here are very courteous, they provide friendly service	Both the directors here treat me excellently well and I feel very happy	Great place with most deserving employees.
Real Good	Very good	Good & friendly.	very very good	Very fair

Comments:

Love the people here - the	Yvonne is excellent	Very well	Excellent services	Everyone has been very
workers are friendly				nice.
Overall service is good.	Great place to be able to	I'm satisfied with services.	Yvonne is great!!!	Overall, very very good.
	go to.		20	
Seniors needs to donate	90% of people don't even	Mr. Bob, Mrs. Lynne, and	Sofia provides great	Rae, who works the office
money for lunch & coffee.	Ä	Sofia all treat me very well,	service, the same goes for	has all needed information
Also, there's a lot of people	coffee! I used to donate			at her finger tips or knows
that doesn't get on line for	coffee about every 3	office in the front. They are	here, I feel very	who to contact. Rae is the
the daily lunch. People	months (3 lbs.) but hardly	all very courteous with me	comfortable here, thank	mainstay of the center.
with good health must get	no one pays anything so no	and everyone I see. They	you very much	•
on line!	more.	try hard.		•
Whon items are denoted to	Whom items are demoter formal individuals manifested total individual at the second at the second at the second at	i Join to have been expensed	Toucher Teacher	a like America change he

replaced because they are rude and always accusing people of stealing. People who volunteer always complain such as Fred! Front office rude to necessary forms for assistance. Time like President Obama says "Time for a change" Also comments from other people will never be seen if not When items are donated to center (several individuals mentioned) take and get 1st pick instead of the seniors. Teachers like Angie should be people who want to join the center. Seniors are scared to say anything. Yvonne (office worker) doesn't have patience to help people fill out favorable.

Friendly and bilingual staff would help. During food distribution wait is longer. Too busy to help sometimes, problems if you don't speak spanish here. Health fair lady - she does not speak Spanish - can't get medical services.

Riverside County Board of Supervisors Request to Speak

Submit request to Clerk of Board (right of podium), Speakers are entitled to three (3) minutes, subject Board Rules listed on the reverse side of this form.

SPEAKER'S NAME: KFBEMA KHOW	19
Address: (only if follow-up mail response requ	ested)
City:zip:	
Phone #: <u>951-784-611</u> 2	4
Date: 6-8-10 Agenda # 0000	lomm
PLEASE STATE YOUR POSITION BELOW:	
Position on "Regular" (non-appealed) Age	enda Item:
SupportOppose	Neutral
Note: If you are here for an agenda item t for "Appeal", please state separately your pathe appeal below:	
SupportOppose	Neutral
I give my 3 minutes to:	

6-8-10