

SUBMITTAL TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

611B



COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA

FROM: TLMA - Planning Department

SUBMITTAL DATE:  
January 23, 2012

SUBJECT: APPEAL OF SURFACE MINING PERMIT NO. 213 (Liberty Quarry), CHANGE OF ZONE NO. 7508 and NOISE ORDINANCE EXCEPTION NO. 2 – Applicant and Appellant: Granite Construction Co. – First/Third Supervisorial Districts.

RECOMMENDED MOTION:

1. Deny the Appeal and Deny the Project.

**TENTATIVELY DENY APPEAL** of SURFACE MINING PERMIT NO. 213 (Liberty Quarry), CHANGE OF ZONE NO. 7508 and NOISE ORDINANCE EXCEPTION NO. 2, subject to the adoption of the denial findings and conclusions; and,

**TENTATIVELY DENY CHANGE OF ZONE NO. 7508**, amending the zoning classification for 110 acres of the subject property from Rural Residential (R-R) to Mineral Resources and Related Manufacturing (M-R-A) in accordance with Exhibit No. 3, subject to the adoption of the denial findings and conclusions; and,

**TENTATIVELY DENY SURFACE MINING PERMIT NO. 213**, with the reduced footprint as modified by the EIR subject to the adoption of the denial findings and conclusions; and,

**TENTATIVELY DENY NOISE ORDINANCE EXCEPTION NO. 2**, pursuant to Section 7 of Ordinance No. 847, requesting exception to Sections 4 and 6 (GENERAL SOUND LEVEL STANDARDS and SPECIAL SOUND SOURCES STANDARDS) based upon the findings and

*Carolyn Syms Luna*  
Carolyn Syms Luna  
Planning Director

Initials:

MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

On motion of Supervisor Buster, seconded by Supervisor Stone and duly carried, IT WAS ORDERED to Deny the Appeal and Deny the Project.

Ayes: Buster, Tavaglione and Stone  
Nays: Benoit and Ashley  
Absent: None  
Date: February 16, 2012  
xc: Planning(2), Applicant, Co.Co.

Kecia Harper-Ihem  
Clerk of the Board  
By *[Signature]*  
Deputy

Prev. Agn. Ref.

District:  
First/Third

Agenda Number:

1.0

REVIEWED BY EXECUTIVE OFFICE

DATE 1/24/12 TML

Departmental Conference Tina Grande

Dep't Recomm.: ☐ Consent ☒ Policy  
Per Exec. Ofc.: ☐ Consent ☒ Policy

The Honorable Board of Supervisors  
Re: Appeal of Surface Mining Permit No. 213,  
Change of Zone No. 7508, and Noise Ordinance Exception No. 2.  
Page 2 of 3

conclusions incorporated in the April 26, 2011 Planning Commission Staff Report, subject to resolution adoption by the Board of Supervisors certifying the Environmental Impact Report; and,

**DIRECT STAFF** to return to the Board with the appropriate resolution incorporating findings and conclusions for denial for the Boards consideration.

Or

2. Uphold the Appeal, Certify the Environmental Impact Report, and Approve the Project.

**UPHOLD APPEAL** of SURFACE MINING PERMIT NO. 213 (Liberty Quarry), CHANGE OF ZONE NO. 7508 and NOISE ORDINANCE EXCEPTION NO. 2; and,

**TENTATIVELY CERTIFY ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT NO. 475** based on the findings incorporated in the April 26, 2011 Planning Commission Staff Report and subject to resolution adoption by the Board of Supervisors certifying the Environmental Impact Report; and,

**TENTATIVELY APPROVE CHANGE OF ZONE NO. 7508**, amending the zoning classification for 110 acres of the subject property from Rural Residential (R-R) to Mineral Resources and Related Manufacturing (M-R-A) in accordance with Exhibit# 3, based upon the findings and conclusions incorporated in the April 26, 2011 Planning Commission Staff Report, subject to adoption of the Final Change of Zone exhibit and Ordinance by the Board of Supervisors; and,

**TENTATIVELY APPROVE SURFACE MINING PERMIT NO. 213**, with the reduced footprint as modified by the EIR and the conditions of approval, and based upon the findings and conclusions incorporated in the April 26, 2011 Planning Commission Staff Report, and subject to resolution adoption by the Board of Supervisors certifying the Environmental Impact Report; and,

**TENTATIVELY APPROVE NOISE ORDINANCE EXCEPTION NO. 2**, pursuant to Section 7 of Ordinance No. 847, requesting exception to Sections 4 and 6 (GENERAL SOUND LEVEL STANDARDS and SPECIAL SOUND SOURCES STANDARDS) based upon the findings and conclusions incorporated in the April 26, 2011 Planning Commission Staff Report, subject to resolution adoption by the Board of Supervisors certifying the Environmental Impact Report.

**BACKGROUND:**

**ON AUGUST 31, 2011 THE PLANNING COMMISSION:**

**DENIED SURFACE MINING PERMIT NO. 213**, subject to the adoption of the findings and conclusions; and,

**DENIED CHANGE OF ZONE NO. 7508**, amending the zoning classification for 110 acres of the subject property from Rural Residential (R-R) to Mineral Resources and Related Manufacturing (M-R-A) in accordance with Exhibit No. 3, subject to the adoption of the findings and conclusions; and,

The Honorable Board of Supervisors  
Re: Appeal of Surface Mining Permit No. 213,  
Change of Zone No. 7508, and Noise Ordinance Exception No. 2.  
Page 3 of 3

**DENIED NOISE ORDINANCE EXCEPTION NO. 2**, pursuant to Section No. 7 of Ordinance No. 847, requesting exception to Section Nos. 4 and 6 subject to the adoption of the findings and conclusions.

**ON DECEMBER 7, 2011 THE PLANNING COMMISSION:**

**ADOPTED** the findings and conclusions for **DENIAL** of the Project.

The Board of Supervisors received and filed the Planning Commission's denial of the Project on January 10, 2012. An appeal was filed by the applicant on December 15, 2011. That appeal is attached for your consideration.

Granite Construction Company (Applicant/Appellant) submitted an application for a surface mining permit to construct and operate an aggregate quarry on a 414 acre site in southwest Riverside County, as well as a change of zone request. Currently, the subject property is located in the First Supervisorial District. Due to recent redistricting efforts, the subject property is being represented by the Third Supervisorial District.

The Project, as analyzed in the EIR, includes the following discretionary actions:

- Surface Mining Permit No. 213, and,
- Change of Zone No. 7508 from Rural Residential (R-R) to Mineral Resources and Related Manufacturing (M-R-A) on 14 parcels consisting of 110 acres near the center of the site, and,
- Noise Ordinance Exception No. 2 which requested an exception from the County noise requirements set forth in Ordinance No. 847.

The Planning Department presented the Project at the April 26, 2011 Planning Commission Hearing and recommended approval of a reduced quarry footprint alternative as presented in the Project EIR. Over the course of six meetings, the Planning Commission heard and considered in excess of fifty hours of public testimony culminating in denial of the Project.

Pursuant to Section No. 15270(a) of the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines, no action was required to certify the EIR since CEQA does not apply to projects which a public agency disapproves. The attached Planning Commission Resolution incorporating denial findings and conclusions represents the reasons for the Planning Commission's denial.

LN	M	LN	Stance	Full Name
*Martland	B.	Bonnie	Opposed	Bonnie B. Martland
Hamilton	F.	Kathleen	Opposed	Kathleen F. Hamilton
coe		charles	Opposed	charles coe
Blois	W.	Doug	Support	Doug W. Blois
THOMPSON	B	DONALD	Support	DONALD B THOMPSON
Harper	J.	Adam	Neutral	Adam J. Harper
Prieto	C.	Joe	Support	Joe C. Prieto
Cousins	J	Kim	Support	Kim J Cousins
Terrell	C.	Daryl	Support	Daryl C. Terrell
Burgner	c	Ann	Support	Ann c Burgner
Marroquis	C	Julio	Support	Julio C Marroquis
Omdahl	L.	Howard	Opposed	Howard L. Omdahl
LOOMIS	B	genelle	Support	genelle B LOOMIS
LOOMIS	E	RICH	Support	RICH E LOOMIS
Lopez	G.	Jackie	Opposed	Jackie G. Lopez
Holmes	H.	Roslyn	Opposed	Roslyn H. Holmes
STALNAKER	R	LAURIE	Support	LAURIE R STALNAKER
BYERS	J	MARIANN	Opposed	MARIANN J BYERS
Curtin	H	Mary	Support	Mary H Curtin
Nielson	R.	Robin	Support	Robin R. Nielson
HOLMES		LESLIE	Opposed	LESLIE HOLMES
Kowell	S.	Bob	Support	Bob S. Kowell
Butler		Benny	Support	Benny Butler
STEPHENS	M	STELLA	Opposed	STELLA M STEPHENS
Johnson	B.	Olden	Support	Olden B. Johnson
Rodriguez	M	Jorge	Neutral	Jorge M Rodriguez
Truman	E.	Larry	Support	Larry E. Truman
WILLIS		JIM	Opposed	JIM WILLIS
JOHNSON		BETTY	Opposed	BETTY JOHNSON
Johnson	A	Lisa	Support	Lisa A Johnson
MITCHELL	L	JIM	Opposed	JIM L MITCHELL
Irene	D	Long	Support	Long D Irene
Davis		1 JoAnn	Support	JoAnn 01 Davis
Vince	A	Vince	Support	Vince A Vince
Davis		JoAnn	Support	JoAnn Davis
ARGANDA	A	JERRI	Opposed	JERRI A ARGANDA
Harrison	M	Gary	Support	Gary M Harrison
Tholes	J	Gera	Support	Gera J Tholes
Harrison	I.	Adele	Support	Adele I. Harrison
BENNETT	A	RAYMOND	Support	RAYMOND A BENNETT
HUNTER		RACHEL	Opposed	RACHEL HUNTER
Welker	F	Jim	Support	Jim F Welker
Bell	W.	Kenny	Support	Kenny W. Bell
JACKSON	R	JOE	Support	JOE R JACKSON
BENNETT	M	JEEN	Support	JEEN M BENNETT
Bunkett	F	Albert	Support	Albert F Bunkett
BRADY	A	RICHARD	Support	RICHARD A BRADY
Tapia Jr.	Y	Richrd	Support	Richrd Y Tapia Jr.
MILLER	S	MARYANN	Support	MARYANN S MILLER

Jan 30, 2012  
Liberty  
Quarry

Basrtel	O.	Claudia	Support	Claudia O. Basrtel
*Parades	M	Alfredo	Support	Alfredo M Parades
MILLER	M	MAX	Support	MAX M MILLER
Campbell	J.	Bill	Support	Bill J. Campbell
PEREZ	J	BILL	Support	BILL J PEREZ
GOMEZ	M	SIMON	Support	SIMON M GOMEZ
BOUYE	D	MIKE	Opposed	MIKE D BOUYE
Otanez	I.	Joe	Support	Joe I. Otanez
Groff	H	Marilyn	Opposed	Marilyn H Groff
BARTZ	J	FRED	Opposed	FRED J BARTZ
Reuther	N.	David	Support	David N. Reuther
Smith	g	William	Support	William g Smith
Lopez	E.	Branden	Support	Branden E. Lopez
HAMMATT	G	MERYLE	Opposed	MERYLE G HAMMATT
STRICKLAND		PHIL	Opposed	PHIL STRICKLAND
Gilbart	D.	Julie	Support	Julie D. Gilbart
WAKSHULL	N	MIKE	Opposed	MIKE N WAKSHULL
HUNTER		PHILLIP	Opposed	PHILLIP HUNTER
HOUSER	J	JULIE	Support	JULIE J HOUSER
LOPEZ	P	ARMONDO	Opposed	ARMONDO P LOPEZ
GOMEZ		DEMETRIO	Support	DEMETRIO GOMEZ
Lockhart	C.	Steven	Support	Steven C. Lockhart
Caracoza, Jr.	D.	Ralph	Support	Ralph D. Caracoza, Jr.
NOLAN	F	GARY	Support	GARY F NOLAN
RODRIGUEZ	J	FERNAND	Support	FERNANDO J RODRIGUEZ
ROUNDS	J	CHUCK	Support	CHUCK J ROUNDS
VALLE	R	RICHARD	Support	RICHARD R VALLE
Stephens		Mark	Opposed	Mark Stephens
Rivera	G.	Eddie	Support	Eddie G. Rivera
Lopez		5 Raul	Support	Raul 05 Lopez
TUCKER	L	JAN	Opposed	JAN L TUCKER
JURKOSKY	K	MIKE	Opposed	MIKE K JURKOSKY
NIELSON	L	ROBIN	Support	ROBIN L NIELSON
Villarreal	G.	Gabriel	Support	Gabriel G. Villarreal
LOCKE	M	MEGAN	Support	MEGAN M LOCKE
Flores	D	Eduardo	Support	Eduardo D Flores
RASPLER	S	JACKIE	Support	JACKIE S RASPLER
JURKOSKY		SUSAN	Opposed	SUSAN JURKOSKY
SCHOLES		BOB	Opposed	BOB SCHOLES
Hohenadl	H	Eike	Support	Eike H Hohenadl
Garcia	F.	Jacob	Support	Jacob F. Garcia
VINTON	R	SCOTT	Support	SCOTT R VINTON
Himes	E	Robert	Support	Robert E Himes
Adcock	R.	Nicholas	Support	Nicholas R. Adcock
JACOBS	J	PAUL	Opposed	PAUL J JACOBS
PASTOR	A	STEVE	Support	STEVE A PASTOR
Connolly		1 Gene	Support	Gene 01 Connolly
DELNAY	H	RICHARD	Opposed	RICHARD H DELNAY
DELNARY	M	NITA	Opposed	NITA M DELNARY
DUVALL	D	STEVE	Opposed	STEVE D DUVALL

TUCKER	H	WALLACE	Opposed	WALLACE H TUCKER
KIDD	W	DENIS	Opposed	DENIS W KIDD
Curtin		1 Mary	Support	Mary 01 Curtin
Velasco		1 Maria	Support	Maria 01 Velasco
PHILLIPS		JAMES	Opposed	JAMES PHILLIPS
TORRES	P	GUADALUF	Support	GUADALUPE P TORRES
GUSTI		DIANNE	Opposed	DIANNE GUSTI
Coles		1 Richard	Opposed	Richard 01 Coles
Salcedo	S.	Nicanor	Support	Nicanor S. Salcedo
BAKER	A	PATRICIA	Opposed	PATRICIA A BAKER
Barnett	L	William	Support	William L Barnett
LIGHT	W	JOHN	Support	JOHN W LIGHT
Matus	C	Louise	Support	Louise C Matus
DILEO		GEORGE	Opposed	GEORGE DILEO
Haldeman	J.	Curtis	Support	Curtis J. Haldeman
RENDALL	R	WILLIAM	Opposed	WILLIAM R RENDALL
FINKELSTEIN		STANLEY	Opposed	STANLEY FINKELSTEIN
Wilder	A.	Kim	Opposed	Kim A. Wilder
Swift		1 Don	Opposed	Don 01 Swift
POWELL	R	JEAN	Opposed	JEAN R POWELL
LOREE	L	ANN	Opposed	ANN L LOREE
Moramarco	A	John	Opposed	John A Moramarco
hayes		LaVon	Opposed	LaVon hayes
Myers	A	Cynthia	Opposed	Cynthia A Myers
FRIEDERICH	H	PETE	Opposed	PETE H FRIEDERICH
DORSEY	P	MARELLE	Opposed	MARELLE P DORSEY
Adkins	W	Roberta	Opposed	Roberta W Adkins
MORIKI	S	SUE	Opposed	SUE S MORIKI
RAGLAND	J	MARILEE	Opposed	MARILEE J RAGLAND
Wilder	H.	Barbara	Opposed	Barbara H. Wilder
LYNCH	L	KATHY	Opposed	KATHY L LYNCH
Watts		Gary	Opposed	Gary Watts
SMITH	L	JOHN	Support	JOHN L SMITH
Roslie		1 Jan	Opposed	Jan 01 Roslie
PAUL	A	JILL	Opposed	JILL A PAUL
PROVENZANO	J	JAMES	Opposed	JAMES J PROVENZANO
MORGAN	A	MICHELLE	Support	MICHELLE A MORGAN
Spadazzi		1 Massimo	Opposed	Massimo 01 Spadazzi
Congress	E	Janet	Support	Janet E Congress
Phelps		Marilyn	Opposed	Marilyn Phelps
TORREZ		LUPE	Support	LUPE TORREZ
SCHMIDT	J	ANDY	Support	ANDY J SCHMIDT
Brady		Jim	Opposed	Jim Brady
SIMONSON	R	LYNETTE	Support	LYNETTE R SIMONSON
GUTIERREZ	G	GUSTAVO	Support	GUSTAVO G GUTIERREZ
CARTER		TEDDY	Support	TEDDY CARTER
SCHRYER	S	RICHARD	Opposed	RICHARD S SCHRYER
ROGERS	B	JOHN	Opposed	JOHN B ROGERS
McLaughlin	m.	Mary Beth	Opposed	Mary Beth m. McLaughlin
CROCKER		WILLIAM	Opposed	WILLIAM CROCKER

MOSER	M	DIONE	Support	DIONE M MOSER
HALES	J	NORMA	Support	NORMA J HALES
VELASCO		MARIA	Support	MARIA VELASCO
YBARRA		ALLAMUNT	Support	ALLAMUNTE YBARRA
Roberts	L.	Boyd	Opposed	Boyd L. Roberts
CLUTE	W	STEVE	Support	STEVE W CLUTE
Vasquez	S.	Mathew	Support	Mathew S. Vasquez
LUA		JESUS	Support	JESUS LUA
LOPEZ		RIEO	Support	RIEO LOPEZ
HAMILTON		JENIFER	Opposed	JENIFER HAMILTON
SANFORD	A	DENNIS	Opposed	DENNIS A SANFORD
DIVECCHIO		MARK	Opposed	MARK DIVECCHIO
ROTHERMUND	S	TYLER	Opposed	TYLER S ROTHERMUND
Graossglass	M.	Meg	Support	Meg M. Graossglass
Swarthout	E.	Patrick	Support	Patrick E. Swarthout
STURGEON	K	PETER	Support	PETER K STURGEON
Shirey	L.	Rick	Support	Rick L. Shirey
JOHNSON	W	RAYMOND	Opposed	RAYMOND W JOHNSON
JOHNSON	J	POLLY	Opposed	POLLY J JOHNSON
HILLEGAS	L	DOROTHY	Opposed	DOROTHY L HILLEGAS
SANCHEZ SR.		ANGEL	Support	ANGEL SANCHEZ SR.
SANCHEZ		JEANETTE	Support	JEANETTE SANCHEZ
PORTIGAL	A	MIKE	Opposed	MIKE A PORTIGAL
VINTON	E	LISA	Support	LISA E VINTON
ACOSTA	G	GEOFF	Support	GEOFF G ACOSTA
Kelly	H.	Mary	Support	Mary H. Kelly
DEBOOM		BARBARA	Support	BARBARA DEBOOM
Schneider	T	Bob	Support	Bob T Schneider
STARR		LINDA	Support	LINDA STARR
Light	A.	Carrie	Support	Carrie A. Light
Ballew	J.	Rob	Support	Rob J. Ballew
DONALDSON	E	JOYCE	Support	JOYCE E DONALDSON
Muller	L.	Mary	Opposed	Mary L. Muller
BLUMBERG	G	MITCH	Support	MITCH G BLUMBERG
Ybarra		Allamonte	Support	Allamonte Ybarra
valle		Richard	Support	Richard valle
Windh		Shawn	Support	Shawn Windh
CONTOPOLOS	W	JIM	Opposed	JIM W CONTOPOLOS
BRENNAN	B	DANIEL	Support	DANIEL B BRENNAN
Vulovic		Jessica	Support	Jessica Vulovic
Hernandez		Nelly	Support	Nelly Hernandez
DAVIS	D	LINDA	Opposed	LINDA D DAVIS
LEIGH	R	DON	Opposed	DON R LEIGH
Valenzuela	J.	Ralph	Support	Ralph J. Valenzuela
WEBSTER		LAURIE	Opposed	LAURIE WEBSTER
Boraston	W.	Geoff	Support	Geoff W. Boraston
Caris	S.	Brian	Support	Brian S. Caris
Bruno		Laura	Support	Laura Bruno
Nelson	D.	Shawn	Opposed	Shawn D. Nelson
Ruse		Michael	Opposed	Michael Ruse

Ruse		1 Michael	Opposed	Michael 1 Ruse
Ruse		2 Phyllis	Opposed	Phyllis 02 Ruse
jones		10 karen	Opposed	karen 10 jones
RC		10 DOC	Opposed	DOC 10 RC
GOLDKORN		RUTHEE	Opposed	RUTHEE GOLDKORN
ROSS	E	VINCENT	Support	VINCENT E ROSS
Esparza	A	Adrian	Support	Adrian A Esparza
CARTER	W	ALAN	Support	ALAN W CARTER
Reuther		Karie	Support	Karie Reuther
Crater	F.	George	Support	George F. Crater
Coles	A	Richard	Support	Richard A Coles
RIVERA	J	JULIAN	Support	JULIAN J RIVERA
GORDON	J	MARY	Opposed	MARY J GORDON
Morales	L	Jose	Support	Jose L Morales
MARTINEZ	B	BENITO	Support	BENITO B MARTINEZ
BARTZ		LINDA	Opposed	LINDA BARTZ
Bartels	S	Kerry	Opposed	Kerry S Bartels
Pirio	A.	Rose	Opposed	Rose A. Pirio
Mobley	Jr.	Crawford	Support	Crawford Jr. Mobley
Ybarra	J.	Norma	Support	Norma J. Ybarra
NIERICH		ELLEN	Opposed	ELLEN NIERICH
ALKEMA		BOB	Opposed	BOB ALKEMA
Luedke	W	Bill	Opposed	Bill W Luedke
Kelliher	P.	John	Opposed	John P. Kelliher
Creek	A.	Scott	Support	Scott A. Creek
Lopez		Jacquelyn	Opposed	Jacquelyn Lopez
Myers	F	Curtis	Opposed	Curtis F Myers
Polk	H.	Dale	Opposed	Dale H. Polk
Johnson	W	Ken	Opposed	Ken W Johnson
Chisholm	A.	Eunice	Opposed	Eunice A. Chisholm
Leonardo		Lucille	Opposed	Lucille Leonardo
		MARCUS	Support	MARCUS
Torres		Carol	Opposed	Carol Torres
Torres		Henry	Opposed	Henry Torres
Barker	P	Laurenn	Opposed	Laurenn P Barker
Norberg		Julie	Opposed	Julie Norberg
Beam		Teo	Opposed	Teo Beam
Fernandez		Arline	Opposed	Arline Fernandez
Merritt	B	Suzanne	Opposed	Suzanne B Merritt
Elser	L.	David	Support	David L. Elser
DeLongehamp	A	Margaret	Support	Margaret A DeLongehamp
ROBINSON	L	IRA	Opposed	IRA L ROBINSON
CRUMBO		KEITH	Opposed	KEITH CRUMBO
BIDDLE JR		NICHOLAS	Opposed	NICHOLAS BIDDLE JR
AMES	E	MARY	Opposed	MARY E AMES
Flaherty	C.	Jack	Opposed	Jack C. Flaherty
EBERHARD		HERGARD	Opposed	HERGARD EBERHARD
MURATALLA	G	MARIA	Opposed	MARIA G MURATALLA
MARROQUIN	C	JULIO	Support	JULIO C MARROQUIN
WORTMAN		TED	Opposed	TED WORTMAN



GEORGE		JAN CLARK	Opposed	JAN CLARK	GEORGE
Santillan		Peter	Support	Peter	Santillan
LaFarga		Robert	Support	Robert	LaFarga
CHIBERK		PRUC	Opposed	PRUC	CHIBERK
FEHER		STEPHANIE	Opposed	STEPHANIE	FEHER
ANGEL		SHEILA	Opposed	SHEILA	ANGEL
ZUN		ANDY	Opposed	ANDY	ZUN
HIBBARD		SARAH	Opposed	SARAH	HIBBARD
ONEILL	G	MIKE	Opposed	MIKE	G ONEILL
GLUSAC	G	RONALD	Opposed	RONALD	G GLUSAC
Mayorga	J.	Andrew	Support	Andrew	J. Mayorga
HANCOCK		DWAYNE	Opposed	DWAYNE	HANCOCK
RITTER		PATSY	Opposed	PATSY	RITTER
Watts		Reg	Opposed	Reg	Watts
GREENWOOD		RICHARD	Opposed	RICHARD	GREENWOOD
PERKINS		DENNISE	Support	DENNISE	PERKINS
CROW		VIVIAN	Opposed	VIVIAN	CROW
CRAWFORD		MARY	Opposed	MARY	CRAWFORD
LONG	G	VICKIE	Opposed	VICKIE	G LONG
ORTEGA	A	JOSE	Opposed	JOSE	A ORTEGA
COBB	A	BETH	Opposed	BETH	A COBB
LEACHMAN		PENNIE	Opposed	PENNIE	LEACHMAN
Jacobs		Rachel	Opposed	Rachel	Jacobs
SILVER	MD	DAN	Opposed	DAN	MD SILVER
Shayassi	T.	Parva	Opposed	Parva	T. Shayassi
MACIAS		MARIA	Opposed	MARIA	MACIAS
Muller	E	Christophe	Opposed	Christopher	E Muller
VASQUEZ	S	MATTHEW	Support	MATTHEW	S VASQUEZ
WILSON	B	AL	Support	AL	B WILSON
JIMENEZ		NANETTE	Opposed	NANETTE	JIMENEZ
BABB	W	DAVID	Support	DAVID	W BABB
Martinez	G.	Robert	Opposed	Robert	G. Martinez
SENSION	A	KRIS	Opposed	KRIS	A SENSION
EAGLE	A	BARBARA	Opposed	BARBARA	A EAGLE
Zahari	E	Charlie	Support	Charlie	E Zahari
GUASSAC	L	LOUIE	Opposed	LOUIE	L GUASSAC
ONEAL	L	PAUL	Support	PAUL	L ONEAL
	Patton	Marion	Opposed	Marion	Patton
Duffley	B.	Lucy	Opposed	Lucy	B. Duffley
Benvenuto		Joe	Opposed	Joe	Benvenuto
Mauer	M	Ann	Support	Ann	M Mauer
Hollingsworth		Dan	Support	Dan	Hollingsworth
Epstein	C	Janet	Support	Janet	C Epstein
Young	L.	Duane	Support	Duane	L. Young
Vaillant-Newman		AnnaMarie	Opposed	AnnaMarie	Vaillant-Newman