

**SUBMITTAL TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

All



FROM: County Auditor-Controller

SUBMITTAL DATE:
April 17, 2013

SUBJECT: County of Riverside Auditor-Controller's Office - Internal Audit Report #2013-001: Countywide Human Resources Recruitment Process – County Departments: Human Resources, District Attorney, Sheriff, and Mental Health

RECOMMENDED MOTION: Receive and file Internal Audit Report #2013-001: Countywide Human Resources Recruitment Process – County Departments: Human Resources, District Attorney, Sheriff, and Mental Health.

BACKGROUND: We have completed a countywide audit of the human resources recruitment process to provide management and the Board of Supervisors with an independent assessment of internal controls over the process. The audit covered the period July 1, 2010 through June 30, 2012. Our audit included four county departments: Human Resources, District Attorney's Office, Sheriff's Department, and Mental Health.

Based upon the results of our audit, we determined the District Attorney's Office, Sheriff's Department, and Mental Health have adequate internal controls over the human resources recruitment process. However, we noted areas for improvement for the Human Resources Department, specifically:

- (1) Adhering to current department policies and procedures;
- (2) Inadequate applicant pool for recruitments of specialized positions; and
- (3) Untimely verification of resumes in Job Match.

We will follow-up within one year to determine if actions were taken to correct the findings noted.

Paul Angulo

Paul Angulo, CPA, MA
County Auditor-Controller

FINANCIAL DATA	Current F.Y. Total Cost:	\$ 0	In Current Year Budget:	N/A
	Current F.Y. Net County Cost:	\$ 0	Budget Adjustment:	N/A
	Annual Net County Cost:	\$ 0	For Fiscal Year:	N/A

SOURCE OF FUNDS: N/A

Positions To Be Deleted Per A-30	<input type="checkbox"/>
Requires 4/5 Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>

C.E.O. RECOMMENDATION:

APPROVE

BY: *Karen L. Johnson*
Karen L. Johnson

County Executive Office Signature

MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

On motion of Supervisor Ashley, seconded by Supervisor Tavaglione and duly carried, IT WAS ORDERED that the above matter is received and filed as recommended.

Ayes: 5
Nays: None
Absent: Benoit
Date: May 7, 2013
xc: Auditor

Kecia Harper-Ihem
Clerk of the Board
By: *Kecia Harper-Ihem*
Deputy

2-43

Prev. Agn. Ref: ATTACHMENTS FILED District: ALL Agenda Number:

Departmental Concurrence

Dept's Recomm.: Policy
Per Exec. Ofc.: Policy
 Consent
 Consent



County of Riverside

INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT

2013-001

Countywide Human Resources Recruitment Process – County Departments: Human Resources, District Attorney, Sheriff, and Mental Health

April 17, 2013

Office of
Paul Angulo, CPA, MA
County Auditor-Controller

4080 Lemon Street
P.O. Box 1326
Riverside, CA 92502-1326



COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE
OFFICE OF THE
AUDITOR-CONTROLLER

County Administrative Center
4080 Lemon Street, 11th Floor
P.O. Box 1326
Riverside, CA 92502-1326
(951) 955-3800
Fax (951) 955-3802

ACO | AUDITOR
CONTROLLER
COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE

Paul Angulo, CPA, MA
AUDITOR-CONTROLLER

April 17, 2013

Honorable Stanley Sniff, Sheriff
Honorable Paul Zellerbach, District Attorney
Barbara Olivier, Assistant CEO/Human Resources Director
Jerry Wengerd, Director, Mental Health

Subject: Internal Audit Report 2013-001: Countywide Human Resources Recruitment Process -
County Departments: Human Resources, District Attorney, Sheriff, and Mental Health

Dear Department Heads:

We have completed a countywide audit of the human resources recruitment process to provide management and the Board of Supervisors with an independent assessment of internal controls over the process. The audit covered the period July 1, 2010 through June 30, 2012. Our audit included four county departments: Human Resources, District Attorney's Office, Sheriff's Department, and Mental Health.

We conducted our audit in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing. These standards require we plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance our objective as described in the preceding paragraph is achieved. The audit included examining, on a test basis, evidence about the department's compliance with the applicable government codes, regulations and resolutions, and performing such other procedures as we considered necessary in the circumstances. We believe the audit provides a reasonable basis for our conclusions.

Internal controls are processes designed to provide management reasonable assurance of achieving operational efficiency, compliance with laws and regulations, and reliability of financial information. Management is responsible for establishing and maintaining adequate internal controls; our responsibility is to assess the adequacy of internal controls based upon our audit.

Based upon the results of our audit, we determined the District Attorney's Office, Sheriff's Department, and Mental Health have adequate internal controls over the human resources recruitment process. However, we noted areas for improvement for the Human Resources Department, specifically:

- (1) Adhering to current department policies and procedures;
- (2) Inadequate applicant pool for recruitments of specialized positions; and

(3) Untimely verification of resumes in Job Match.

We discussed the results contained in this report, as well as comments and suggestions of lesser significance, with the appropriate level of management in the course of the audit. Management's responses are included as an attachment.

We thank your department for their cooperation and assistance during the audit.

Paul Angulo, CPA, MA
County Auditor-Controller



By: Rachelle Román, CRMA, MPA
Chief Internal Auditor

Cc: Executive Office
Grand Jury

Attachment

Table of Contents

	Page
Executive Summary.....	1
Results:	
Human Resources Department	3
District Attorney's Office	7
Sheriff's Department	8
Mental Health	9

Executive Summary

Overview

Riverside County Salary Ordinance 440 sets forth the terms and conditions of employment for certain groups of employees and provides for the creation and exchange of positions in the County of Riverside. As such, it allows agency/department heads to appoint and employ assistants, deputies, and employees.

All county departments are required to complete a Schedule 20, which provides a basis for the annual budget submitted and details personnel requirements. This report is monitored monthly by the departments to utilize as a tool for tracking currently filled or vacant positions, including salaries, benefits, and any other collective bargaining provisions. The recruitment process begins when a budgeted position becomes vacant due to an employee retiring, transferring to a different department, promoting, terminating, or a new position is authorized. Submission of a (CRF) Candidate Request Form to Human Resources initiates the formal recruitment process.

Based upon a countywide risk assessment conducted by an independent third party, the results indicated Human Resources, District Attorney's Office, Sheriff's Department, and Mental Health would most benefit from an audit over the human resources recruitment process; therefore, were included in the review. Each department is assigned to a Human Resources Services Team, which assists and facilitates the recruitment process. During the process, the HR Analyst and Department Manager/Supervisor are responsible for the timely completion of various forms, recruitment folders, assessment/selection of resumes and candidates, background checks, and other phases of the recruitment process.

Audit Objective

Our audit objective is to provide management and the Board of Supervisors with an independent assessment of internal controls over the human resource recruitment process.

Audit Methodology

To accomplish our objectives, we:

- Identified and reviewed policies, applicable laws, codes, regulations, board ordinances;
- Conducted interviews and performed walkthroughs with department personnel;
- Obtained and analyzed county recruitment policies and other documents to obtain an understanding of the recruitment process;
- Compared authorized positions with budgeted positions;
- Evaluated summary of authorized positions to ensure open positions existed;

- Reviewed the job vacancy advertisements, internally and/or externally, for length of posting;
- Selected samples of recruitments to perform detailed testing;
- Documented the recruitment timeline for each department, (where possible); and
- Verified whether departments' recruitments are processed in a timely manner and complied with Human Resources guidelines.

Audit Conclusion

Based upon the results of our audit, we determined the District Attorney's Office, Sheriff's Department, and Mental Health have adequate internal controls over the human resources recruitment process. However, we noted areas for improvement for the Human Resources Department, specifically:

- (1) Adhering to current department policies and procedures;
- (2) Inadequate applicant pool for recruitments of specialized positions; and
- (3) Untimely verification of resumes in Job Match.

Human Resources Department

Background

Riverside County serves over 2 million residents and employs over 18,000 employees. The Human Resources Department is committed to fulfilling their mission statement "through strategic partnerships with departments, we attract and retain a motivated and skilled workforce by championing a Great Place to Work so that employees are committed to delivering valuable and effective services to the people of Riverside County."

The Human Resources Department is comprised of 20 divisions/specialty areas offering a variety of services to county departments. One of the major functional areas of the department is Recruitment. The Recruitment Division provides a vital first contact with the general public and potential candidates for Riverside County employment. This division is responsible for performing various recruiting functions including evaluating employment resumes to establish hiring certification lists. The hiring certification lists are utilized by county agencies/departments to fill their current job vacancies.

Riverside County job openings are accessible via any computer with internet access at their website www.rc-hr.com/. In addition, kiosk computers for accessing their website during business hours are available on the first floor of the County Administrative Center in downtown Riverside.

Human Resources utilizes the Job Match System, an electronic resume scanning recruitment system that enables applicants to submit their resume to be retained in the database for any county positions where they meet the qualifications. The Job Match System provides recruiters a database of resumes to review and evaluate to serve the employment needs of county agencies/departments.

The *Job Match Recruitment Manual*, developed by the department, provides pertinent information on recruitment processes and policies as well as step-by-step procedures detailing the recruitment process and use of the system. The Job Match software provides a means of reading the scanned resumes; extracting the knowledgebase skills and creating a resume file which can be searched for potential candidates. The manual also details procedures for recruiters on processing the (CRF) Candidate Requisition Form, handling the receipt of resumes, completing the position evaluations, searching resumes for established criteria; posting job opportunities on websites, such as Riverside County Human Resources, NeoGov.com or California Government Jobs (cagovjobs.com), tracking/contacting candidates, and administering exams and assessments.

Finding 1: Department does not adhere to policies and procedures in *Job Match Manual*.

- (a) 6 of 10 CRFs (Candidate Requisition Forms) were not date stamped upon receipt nor were the receipt dates documented in the recruitment folders. In accordance with the Human Resources *Job Match Manual*, requisitions are to be created in Job Match within one business day of receiving the CRFs from hiring departments. Since receipt dates are not noted, we are unable to test and determine if requisitions are entered in Job Match in a timely manner or within one business day, as required by department policy.

Untimely processing of CRFs delays the recruitment process and may result in providing poor customer service to county departments.

- (b) 3 of 26 CRFs reviewed were considered incomplete due to missing information; however a requisition was still processed. In accordance with the Human Resources *Job Match Manual*, a recruiter has three business days to obtain missing information from the hiring authority otherwise the CRF should be returned to the hiring authority to accurately complete the form and resubmit. Upon discussion with staff, the missing information was collected via telephone; however, the CRF was not updated with the missing information. Processing requisitions without complete information on the CRF may provide erroneous results that may go undetected.
- (c) In 21 of 26 recruitments reviewed, we identified candidates who were not sent an *Unable to Contact Letter* for those candidates classified as difficult to contact due to disconnected/incorrect phone numbers or email addresses on file. In accordance with the Human Resources *Job Match Manual*, an *Unable to Contact Letter* should be sent to the address of record informing candidates of the interview opportunity. The impact of not attempting to notify qualified candidates for interviews may result in losing the opportunity of hiring highly talented candidates for vital positions in the county.
- (d) 4 of 26 recruitment folders were missing pertinent information. The department utilizes a *Recruitment Folder Content Checklist* to ensure all required documents are maintained. However, we identified three recruitment folders missing a signed certification list and one recruitment folder missing a pre-screening candidate contact log, although signature evidencing completeness of files by staff was documented. In accordance with the Human Resources *Job Match Manual*, a completed certification list is required to be kept in the recruitment folder as stated in the recruitment folder contents checklist. Lack of pertinent information being properly maintained in the recruitment folder may result in exposure to liability regarding hiring practices.

Recommendation 1(a): Adhere to Human Resources *Job Match Manual* requirements by date stamping CRFs upon receipt to provide a tracking mechanism to ensure requisitions are created in Job Match within one business day of receipt.

Recommendation 1(b): Adhere to Human Resources *Job Match Manual* requirements by ensuring requisitions are not processed until a complete CRF is submitted by the hiring authority.

Recommendation 1(c): Adhere to Human Resources *Job Match Manual* requirements by ensuring an *Unable to Contact Letter* is sent to candidates classified as difficult to contact.

Recommendation 1(d): Adhere to Human Resources *Job Match Manual* requirements by ensuring all elements of the *Recruitment Folder Content Checklist* are properly maintained in all recruitment folders.

Finding 2: Inadequate applicant pool for recruitments of specialized positions.

The results of a recent countywide risk assessment conducted by an independent consultant revealed a common weakness among at least 4 of 10 departments interviewed during their

review that the recruitment process conducted by County Human Resources does not consistently produce an applicant pool of qualified candidates.

During our interviews with hiring departments, we substantiated the above noted results and found that at times, departments experienced inefficient hiring practices due to inadequate applicant pools for recruitments of specialized positions. Specifically noted was a recruitment conducted for the District Attorney's Office which resulted with 481 qualified candidates on the job certification listing to fill one vacancy. The *Official Job Match Hiring Certification List* prepared and distributed to departments by Human Resources states, "Departments are mandated by county policy to interview all candidates on the certification list." We requested Human Resources to provide a copy of the county policy; however, they were not able to provide the policy for our review.

In the above mentioned recruitment, the District Attorney's Office management indicated it was not possible to interview all 481 candidates due to time constraints and inefficient use of human resources. Instead, the hiring committee reviewed the resumes and selected 115 candidates to interview. It took the hiring committee six days to interview the 115 candidates for the one vacancy. The table below depicts the actual expense of conducting the 115 interviews versus the potential cost of conducting 481 interviews with the candidates listed on the *Official Job Match Hiring Certification List*. We computed actual salary of the 9 panel members that conducted the interviews and utilized the average hourly rate, along with a 40% basis to compute benefits. Based on this analysis, if the District Attorney's Office would have conducted interviews for all 481 candidates listed on the *Official Job Match Hiring Certification List*, it would have cost the department an additional \$218,488 to complete this portion of the interview process.

Interview Process Analysis

<i>Comparison</i>	<i>Total Hours to Conduct Interviews</i>	<i>Total Cost</i>
<i>Actual Expense of Conducting 115 Interviews (Salary & Benefits of 9 Panel Members)</i>	432	\$54,480
<i>Potential Expense of Conducting 481 Interviews (Salary & Benefits of 9 Panel Members)</i>	2,164.5	\$272,968
<i>Potential Additional Costs:</i>		<i>\$218,488</i>

In circumstances that warrant specific technical skill sets that may be difficult for a Human Resources recruiter to identify, the department/hiring committee should be permitted to review the pooled candidates and interview those candidates that best meet the specifications and qualifications of the position. This change in procedure will increase efficiency and effectiveness and can potentially result in a cost savings over the hiring process.

Recommendation 2:

HR recruiters work collaboratively with department hiring managers to clearly identify technical skills required to produce an adequate pool of recruitments for specialized positions.

Recommendation 2.1:

Reevaluate current county or department policies and procedures in regards to mandating the interviewing of all candidates on the *Official Job Match Hiring Certification List* prepared and distributed to departments by Human Resources. Department management and personnel are professionals in their respective fields, and therefore, should be allowed to evaluate and select candidates to interview that best meet the requirements of the recruited position from the certification list.

Finding 3: Untimely verification of resumes in Job Match

Candidates apply for open positions with the county by either submitting resumes via Job Match or by emailing resumes directly to service team recruiters, dependent on the specific requirements stated in the supplemental information of the job posting. Upon submittal in Job Match, resumes are verified by HR Talent Management team members to ensure Job Match converts the resumes into electronic text files accurately. On any given day, there are approximately 2,000 to 7,000 resumes placed in queue waiting to be verified. On average, the age of resumes waiting for verifications is two to three weeks. This backlog of resumes of awaiting verification is due to staffing issues as a result of recent budget cuts. To lessen the backlog, service team recruiters have set up dedicated email addresses to receive resumes directly for specific recruitments.

When job postings close and recruiters begin to perform resume searches in the Job Match System, it is possible the resume population the recruiters are searching from is incomplete, since there may be approximately 2,000 to 7,000 unverified resumes still in the queue waiting for verification. Consequently, candidates who apply for specific positions might not be evaluated and considered due to untimely verification of resumes in the Job Match System. This negates the county's merit base policy to select the best candidate for the job so that the county can maintain a quality workforce.

Recommendation 3:

The department is currently in the process of implementing a new recruiting software system to improve the efficiency of resume verification. We recommend the new software system be thoroughly analyzed to ensure circumstances as noted above do not occur in the new system.

District Attorney's Office

Background

The District Attorney's Office provides prosecution services to the community, to law enforcement agencies, and to the needy children and families of Riverside County. The District Attorney's Office employs over 700 employees in the Western, Eastern and Southwest portions of the county. The major divisions of the Office are Administration, Executive, Victim Services and the Bureau of Investigation. Some of the types of cases prosecuted by the District Attorney's Office include homicide, drug enforcement, sexual assault crimes, and domestic violence crimes. The department has offices in Riverside, Indio, Murrieta, Banning, and Blythe.

The District Attorney's Office has detailed documented written procedures over the recruitment process. These procedures include detailed information on how to conduct the following:

- Preparing/Submitting Candidate Request Form;
- Sending out internal recruitment announcements;
- Updating the Recruitment Log for the monitoring/tracking of all recruitments;
- Setting up interviews for the candidates listed on the Official Certification List;
- Preparing the interviewing schedule and distributing to the hiring manager;
- Compilation of scores and scheduling second interviews;
- Offers of employment; and
- Sending out notifications for unsuccessful candidates.

For FY2011 and FY2012, we selected a sample of 10 recruitments to perform detailed testing. Based on our results, the District Attorney's Office has adequate internal controls over the human resources recruitment process. No exceptions were noted.

Sheriff's Department

Background

The Riverside County Sheriff's Department has grown from a one-person operation encompassing 7,200 square miles when it was established in 1893 to a law enforcement team of over 4,000 dedicated men and women. The county is the fourth largest in California and is considered one of the fastest growing counties in the country. With a population of more than 2.2 million, the department is responsible for patrolling 17 out of 28 cities and one Tribal community in Riverside County.

The Sheriff's Department core services include First Responders, Police Services, Search and Rescue, Emergency Response, Mutual Aid Coordination, Enforcement of Criminal Law on tribal lands, operation of a Jail System to serve all agencies and local courts, countywide court security and civil process services, Coroner-Public Administration responsibilities, and is a member or lead agency for a number of federal, state, and local joint task force efforts. To ensure these services are provided continuously by quality individuals, the Sheriff's Personnel Unit works closely with their dedicated (HRST) Human Resources Services Team to attract and hire individuals who possess desirable qualities of integrity, loyalty, professionalism, and leadership.

The HRST is responsible for administering a number of job specific pre-employment written and other skills based examination, such as typing and the dispatcher oriented CRITI-CALL test. Additionally, HRST is tasked with scheduling and managing physical agility test, polygraph examinations, coordinating with occupational health to complete medical and psychological examinations, and marketing the department's job needs. The hiring process for (DST) Deputy Sheriff Trainee, (CD) Correctional Deputy, and Dispatcher are extensive and involve a pre-screening application, written test, physical agility test (DST and CD), background investigation, fingerprinting/credit check, polygraph, and psychological/medical exams. Emergency 911 Dispatcher and Classified candidates also have specific requirements that are addressed during the hiring process.

The Sheriff Department's hiring posture was significantly impacted due to the economic downturn, which started in late 2007. By 2011, the department was only hiring for critically needed positions and had almost completely stopped hiring deputy sheriffs. Although the department experienced a reduction in staffing, the HRST and Sheriff's Personnel Teams processed over 14,000 applications. In mid-2012, marketing was reinitiated to attract applicants for all levels of Sheriff's staffing. The HRST and Sheriff's Personnel Teams processed over 22,000 applications in 2012. The department is satisfied with the progress of the hiring process and is continually looking for opportunities to increase the number of quality applicants to join the Sheriff's Department.

The Sheriff's Department indicated they were prevented by the provisions of Government Code 3300, commonly known as the Peace Officers Bill of Rights, from providing access to candidate background files for the audit. However, an annual audit of those files is conducted by representatives of the (POST) Peace Officer Standards and Training Commission. The scope of their review included determining whether the department complied with POST guidelines.

For fiscal years 2010-11 and 2011-12 we selected a sample of 31 candidates for detailed testing. We were able to collaborate with Sheriff Department staff to ensure the candidate files comprised results from pre-screening, written examination, physical agility, background completion and hire date. Based on our results, the Sheriff's Department has adequate internal controls over the human resources recruitment process. No exceptions were noted.

Mental Health

Background

Mental Health provides community-based services to severely mentally disabled adults and older adults, children at risk of mental disability, substance abusers, and individuals on conservatorship. Mental Health services three geographic regions: Western (metropolitan Riverside); Mid-County (Hemet, Temecula, Perris, Lake Elsinore, and environs); and Desert (Banning, Palm Springs, Indio, Blythe and environs).

Mental Health provides services through three major programs: Mental Health Services, Substance Abuse Services, and the Public Guardian's Office. Mental Health provides treatment and support to transition age youth, adults, and older adults with mental illness and severely emotionally disturbed children. Substance Abuse provides substance abuse treatment for all ages through a wide range of county wide clinics and contract providers. Public Guardian provides conservatorship services while working closely with the mental health case management program to provide a representative payee service to qualified clients.

The Department has detailed documented written procedures over the recruitment process in their *Training Program for Recruitment Process* procedural document. These procedures include detailed information on how to conduct the following:

- Preparing/Submitting Candidate Request Form;
- Preparing/Reviewing/Submitting the job vacancy package;
- Procedures in regards to the process upon receiving the Official Job Match Hiring Certification List;
- The composition of the selection committee, which usually includes two to three managers;
- Setting up interviews for the candidates listed on the Official Certification List;
- Compilation of scores and scheduling second interviews;
- Reference checks;
- Offers of employment; and
- Sending out notifications for unsuccessful candidates.

For fiscal years 2010-11 and 2011-12 we selected a sample of 26 recruitments to perform detailed testing. Based on our results, Mental Health has adequate internal controls over the human resources recruitment process. No exceptions were noted.



MEMORANDUM

Human Resources Department
Barbara A. Olivier
 Assistant County Executive Officer/
 Human Resources Director

DATE: April 15, 2013

TO: Auditor-Controller's Office
 Internal Audit Division

FROM: Barbara Olivier, Assistant CEO/ Human Resources Director
 Riverside County Human Resources Department

SUBJECT: Reply to Draft Internal Audit Report 2013-001: Countywide Human Resources Recruitment Process

Finding 1: Department does not adhere to policies and procedures in *Job Match Manual*.

- (a) 6 of 10 CRFs (Candidate Requisition Forms) were not date stamped upon receipt nor were the receipt dates documented in the recruitment folders. In accordance with the Human Resources *Job Match Manual*, requisitions are to be created in Job Match within one business day of receiving the CRFs from hiring departments. Since receipt dates are not noted, we are unable to test and determine if requisitions are entered in Job Match in a timely manner or within one business day, as required by department policy. Untimely processing of CRFs delays the recruitment process and may result in providing poor customer service.
- (b) 3 of 26 CRFs reviewed were considered incomplete due to missing information; however a requisition was still processed. In accordance with the Human Resources *Job Match Manual*, a recruiter has three business days to obtain missing information from the hiring authority otherwise the CRF should be returned to the hiring authority to accurately complete the form and resubmit. Upon discussion with staff, the missing information was collected via telephone; however, the CRF was not updated with the missing information. Processing requisitions without complete information on the CRF may provide erroneous results that may go undetected.
- (c) In 21 of 26 recruitments reviewed, we identified candidates that were not sent an *Unable to Contact Letter* for those candidates classified as difficult to contact due to disconnected/incorrect phone numbers or email addresses on file. In accordance with the Human Resources *Job Match Manual*, an *Unable to Contact Letter* should be sent to the address of record informing candidates of the interview opportunity. The impact of not attempting to notify qualified candidates for interviews may result in not hiring highly talented candidates for vital positions in the county.
- (d) 4 of 26 recruitment folders were missing pertinent information. The department utilizes a *Recruitment Folder Content Checklist* to ensure all required documents are maintained. However, we identified three recruitment folders missing a signed certification list and one recruitment folder missing a pre-screening candidate contact log, although signature evidencing completeness of files by staff was documented. In accordance with the

Human Resources *Job Match Manual*, a completed certification list is required to be kept in the recruitment folder as stated in the recruitment folder contents checklist. Lack of pertinent information being properly maintained in the recruitment folder may result in exposure to liability regarding hiring practices.

Management position concerning the finding: Partially Concur

Comments:

The Human Resources Department only partially concurs with the finding that the Department is not adhering to policies and procedures in the JobMatch Manual. Overall, processes are consistently followed and recruitments are carefully reviewed to ensure conformity with the required procedures. The assertions in the findings must be taken in context of their overall impact, and still allow discretion to be responsive to business needs of the hiring departments.

Related to Finding 1(a), the Human Resources Department concurs that the date of receipt is not "date stamped" by HR upon receipt of a CRF. The Form contains a field (Box 3) that is labeled "(HR Use) Date Received by Central H.R, where it is instead hand written on the date of receipt. Some Human Resources Department offices may be machine date stamping materials received, but JobMatch procedures do not require a "date stamp" on a received CRF. This should not be characterized as a lack of adherence to procedures, when a date stamp is not required.

Related to Finding 1(b), the Human Resources Department concurs that some CRFs may have lacked certain information but the requisition was still processed. Occasionally departments may not have Position Control Number information available at the time a requisition is submitted. This information is not critical to opening recruitment activity, but is required before a candidate can be hired. In the past, the Human Resources Department had required departments to supply a valid Position Control Number with each recruitment, but this caused unreasonable delays when departments were exchanging or obtaining Position Control Numbers, when recruitment could be proactively underway. It is prudent for the recruiter to evaluate the CRF and occasionally begin proactive recruiting activity before the Position Control Number is available. As information becomes available, it is noted in the Recruiter Notes in the JobMatch system. This deviation from the stated requirement for a complete CRF should not be characterized as not adhering to policies and procedures; it is a prudent exercise of discretion that facilitates efficient recruiting. The information is collected before it is required for hire processing.

Related to Finding 1(c), the Human Resources Department concurs that Unable to Contact letters were not sent to applicants who provided contact information that was inaccurate. JobMatch Manual procedures required recruiters who were unable to contact candidates to inactivate the candidate's resume and send the candidate a postal letter notifying the candidate that they were unable to be contacted. In the past, the Human Resources Department had more staff to facilitate this process. With budget cuts in recent years, it became impractical for recruiters to print and mail letters for every applicant who has not provided valid contact

information. Postage and mailing expenses were also a requirement of this procedure. It was observed in the audit that staff are not consistently following procedures to mail the letters. We concur that procedures should be followed, but recognize that a procedural adjustment is warranted to allow electronic delivery (email) of the communication to applicants who are unable to be contacted. The Manual will be revised to reflect this option.

Related to Finding 1(d), the Human Resources Department concurs that some recruitment files provided to the auditors lacked pertinent information; this most frequently relates to return of a completed certification list after candidate selections have been made. Before recruitments can be closed and updated in JobMatch, and folders filed by the HR Department, they should be reviewed to ensure all documents have been returned from hiring departments. Occasionally, recruiters must request the completed certification list from departments when they have not been returned timely. We concur that certain files examined in the audit were lacking the final copy of the completed certification list. Follow up requests were performed to try to obtain copies of the missing documents to complete the files identified in the audit.

Recommendation 1(a):

Adhere to Human Resources *Job Match Manual* requirements by date stamping CRFs upon receipt to provide a tracking mechanism to ensure requisitions are created in Job Match within one business day of receipt.

Management position concerning the recommendation: Do Not Concur

Comments:

This recommendation will not be implemented. The Job Match manual does not state that a CRF must be date stamped upon receipt. This is not currently a requirement of the recruiting process and should therefore not be characterized as a finding where the Department is not following policies and procedures. The JobMatch Manual requires that a recruiter open a recruitment within three days of receipt of a completed requisition. The Job Match software tracks the date the requisition was created in a field that cannot be edited by the recruiter. The CRF currently provides a method for noting the date of CRF receipt by Central Human Resources in Box 3 of the form. As a follow up to this audit, staff will be reminded that the date of receipt of the completed CRF should be noted in Box 3 of the form. Requiring a physical date stamp of the document is redundant to other recordkeeping that is already in place.

Recommendation 1(b):

Adhere to Human Resources *Job Match Manual* requirements by ensuring requisitions are not processed until a complete CRF is submitted by the hiring authority.

Management position concerning the recommendation: Partially Concur

Comments:

This recommendation is already standard practice prior to the audit. Standard procedures require completed information on the CRF; however the Human Resources Department will continue to retain discretion to proceed on a recruitment when it is prudent to be proactive before all CRF information is available. JobMatch Manual procedures currently provide that recruiters open a recruitment within three days of receipt of a *completed* CRF. In practice, however, departments often submit CRFs lacking certain information that may be pending, typically Position Control numbers (Box 15). Practice has shown that recruiters can exercise discretion to be responsive to departmental recruitment needs by allowing a recruitment to begin before this information is available. Starting a recruitment before a Position Control Number (Box 15) is available is of no significant impact because candidates may not ultimately be hired without valid Position Control Numbers upon which they can be employed. By proceeding without the information, the HR Department can be more responsive to department requests while position information may be worked out. Departments may be awaiting new fiscal year Position Control Numbers, or exchanging existing Position Control Numbers. Recruiters take note of the information as it is received in the Recruiter Notes section of the JobMatch software. Recruiters must use judgment, in consultation with their managers, about when acting proactively on a recruitment is appropriate by identifying information that can be gathered during the recruitment process, or whether required information must be collected before the recruitment is started. Additional clarifying information will be added to the JobMatch manual to note that use of discretion may be appropriate when an incomplete CRF is evaluated.

Recommendation 1(c):

Adhere to Human Resources *Job Match Manual* requirements by ensuring an *Unable to Contact Letter* is sent to candidates classified as difficult to contact.

Management position concerning the recommendation: Concur

Comments:

In response to the audit findings, procedures have been modified to allow the unable to contact letter to be sent by email rather than postal mail. This change provides a more efficient and cost effective method to deliver this communication to candidates. The JobMatch Manual has been updated to reflect this change and staff have been trained on the new procedure to follow when unable to contact candidates. The necessity of completing this process was reinforced with staff.

Recommendation 1(d):

Adhere to Human Resources *Job Match Manual* requirements by ensuring all elements of the *Recruitment Folder Content Checklist* are properly maintained in all recruitment folders.

Management position concerning the recommendation: Concur

Comments:

Occasionally, departments neglect to return a copy of the completed certification list to Human Resources Department recruiters; however, it is the recruiters' responsibility to follow up and obtain a completed certification list in order to close the recruitment. This procedure was reinforced with Human Resources Department staff performing recruiting to ensure all documentation is collected at the completion of a recruitment. Human Resources Services Teams have implemented a pre-filing review to ensure all documentation is in place before a file is placed in closed files.

Finding 2: Inadequate applicant pool for recruitments of specialized positions.

The results of a recent countywide risk assessment conducted by an independent consultant revealed a common weakness among at least 4 of 10 departments interviewed during their review that the recruitment process conducted by County Human Resources does not consistently produce an applicant pool of qualified candidates.

During our interviews with hiring departments, we substantiated the above noted results and found that at times, departments experienced inefficient hiring practices due to inadequate applicant pools for recruitments of specialized positions. Specifically noted was a recruitment conducted for the District Attorney's Office which resulted with 481 qualified candidates on the job certification listing to fill one vacancy. The *Official Job Match Hiring Certification List* prepared and distributed to departments by Human Resources states, "Departments are mandated by County policy to interview all candidates on the certification list." We requested Human Resources to provide a copy of the county policy; however, they were not able to provide the policy for our review.

In the above mentioned recruitment, the District Attorney's Office management indicated it was not possible to interview all 481 candidates due to time constraints and inefficient use of human resources. Instead, the hiring committee reviewed the resumes and selected 115 candidates to interview. It took the hiring committee six days to interview the 115 candidates for the one vacancy. The table below depicts the actual expense of conducting the 115 interviews versus the potential cost of conducting 481 interviews with the candidates listed on the *Official Job Match Hiring Certification List*. We computed actual salary of the 9 panel members that conducted the interviews and utilized the average hourly rate, along with a 40% basis to compute benefits. Based on this analysis, if the District Attorney's Office would have conducted interviews for all 481 candidates listed on the *Official Job Match Hiring Certification List*, it would have cost the department an additional \$218,488 to complete this portion of the interview process.

In circumstances that warrant specific technical skill sets that may be difficult for a Human Resources recruiter to identify, the department/hiring committee should be permitted to review the pooled candidates and interview those candidates that best meet the specifications and qualifications of the position. This change in procedure will increase efficiency and effectiveness and can potentially result in a cost savings over the hiring process.

Management position concerning the finding: Do Not Concur

Comments:

The Human Resources Department does not concur that a "countywide risk assessment conducted by an independent consultant revealed a common weakness among at least 4 of 10 departments interviewed during their review." The Human Resources Department was provided a draft copy of the Performance Audit Planning Assessment conducted by IntelliBridge Partners, dated June 2012. This assessment provided IntelliBridge's opinions of departments who could benefit from a performance audit, and to support the Internal Audit Division's efforts in its development of a performance audit work plan. Ten of the County's more than 40 departments participated in the assessment, and of those 10 participants four respondents does not reveal a "common weakness."

It should be noted that the District Attorney's Office was among the 10 participants but IntelliBridge Partners' Assessment Results for the DA's Office noted "there may be a need for an internal or performance audit that addresses information management activities for the department, but the audit would not necessarily have an impact on service delivery or cost savings. Overall, the District Attorney's Office did not have issues that could significantly benefit from an internal or performance audit."

The audit finding discussion of the recruitment conducted at the District Attorney's Office mischaracterizes recruitment and omits mitigating actions that were taken. While it was *one* recruitment effort, this recruitment effort sought to fill 10 vacancies in the department. The desired number of candidates desired for interview specified by the District Attorney's Office on the CRF was 100. The job classification was Deputy District Attorney I - III, a highly competitive position that was advertised to the public and generated significant applicant response. The Human Resources Services Team had previously worked with the District Attorney's Office on similar recruitments where the department requested to interview all candidates who met the position requirements. In this recruitment, and consistent with past experiences with prior administration, all candidates who met the position requirements were certified eligible for hire and sent to the department for interviewing. This occurred without discussion of the unusually high quantity of candidates. The recruiter should have had further discussion with the District Attorney's Office about narrowing the candidate pool to only the most highly qualified applicants among the 481, but instead relied on past experience with Deputy District Attorney recruitments and sent all qualified candidates to the department for interview.

After the list was certified, narrowing of the candidate pool to identify the most highly qualified candidates occurred in the District Attorney's Office, in consultation with the Assistant HR

Director. After further screening, 125 applicants were interviewed by the District Attorney's Office, and 10 selections were made. In this recruitment, the applicant pool was more than sufficient and should not be characterized as the Human Resources Department producing an inadequate applicant pool.

In this instance, the Human Resources Department acknowledges that better communication between the Human Resources Department and the District Attorney's Office prior to the certification of 481 candidates would have been a better approach. However, this recruitment cannot be characterized as typical or representative in any way.

Related to the recommendation that the department/hiring committee should be permitted to review the pooled candidates, it is standard practice and written in JobMatch procedures that the Human Resources Department's recruiters conduct a Position Evaluation with hiring managers for each recruitment. The Position Evaluation identifies the knowledge, skills, and abilities required for the position in recruitment so recruiters can identify candidates who are appropriate. This discussion is the key to meeting department requirements, in addition to the information specified on the CRF and classification specification. When recruiters conduct recruitments, they search for candidates resumes matched with job requirements via the JobMatch system, where more than 150,000 active resumes are available to consider for recruitments. It is unreasonable to expect hiring managers to take on the review of candidates in the JobMatch pool, this is a function performed by Human Resources recruiters because it requires specific expertise and technical ability to operate the JobMatch search process. Hiring managers should be active participants in defining the job related requirements of the position, however, the actual search of the candidate pool must be certified by skilled Human Resources staff.

Some recruitments with specific technical requirements can pose challenges because skills may be scarce in the County applicant pool, skills may not exist in applicants in the County's geographic region, applicants may be unwilling to relocate, advertising may be required to generate sufficient candidate response but departments may not be willing to pay advertising costs, applicants may be uninterested in the job location, County wages and benefits may lag behind other employers, and many other issues that create difficulties in filling County vacancies. It is important for the recruiters and hiring managers to work closely to identify recruiting requirements; this is stated in current JobMatch procedures.

Recommendation 2:

HR recruiters work collaboratively with department hiring managers to clearly identify technical skills required to produce an adequate pool of recruitments for specialized positions.

Management position concerning the recommendation: Concur

Comments:

The Human Resources Department concurs with this recommendation and it has already been implemented as standard practice. Since June 2004, it has been a requirement of JobMatch procedures and specified in JobMatch recruiter training that the Human Resources Department's recruiters conduct a Position Evaluation for each recruitment. The Position Evaluation discussion identifies the knowledge, skills, and abilities required for the position in recruitment so recruiters can identify candidates who are appropriate during the selection process. The Position Evaluation discussion is the key to meeting department requirements, in addition to the information specified on the CRF and classification specification. Many department managers also include subject matter experts (SMEs) during Position Evaluation discussions, and frequently recruiters visit work locations to understand more about work requirements and department operations. During recruitment processes, recruiters search for candidates in the JobMatch system, where more than 150,000 active resumes are available to consider. Some recruitments can pose challenges because skills may be scarce in the County applicant pool, skills may not exist in applicants in the County's geographic region and applicants are unwilling to relocate, advertising may be required to generate sufficient candidate response but departments are not willing to pay ad costs, applicants may not be interested in the job location, wages and benefits may lag other more competitive employers, and many other issues that create difficulties in filling County vacancies. It is important for the recruiters and hiring managers to work closely to identify recruiting requirements. Some problems in recruitments require a more sophisticated response to the challenge, such as adjustments to the County's compensation approach, job redesign, initiating training programs, and other solutions.

Recommendation 2.1:

Reevaluate current county or department policies and procedures in regards to mandating the interviewing of all candidates on the *Official Job Match Hiring Certification List* prepared and distributed to departments by Human Resources. Department management and personnel are professionals in their respective fields, and therefore, should be allowed to evaluate and select candidates to interview that best meet the requirements of the recruited position from the certification list.

Management position concerning the recommendation: Do Not Concur

Comments:

The Human Resources Department does not concur and will not implement this recommendation. Departments are required to interview all candidates who are certified as eligible. Hiring managers specify position requirements during the Position Evaluation (see Recommendation 2) and candidates who are among the most highly qualified and meet those requirements are referred for interview. Department managers are asked to specify the desired number of candidates to interview on the CRF document. Recruiters are trained to evaluate position requirements so that they are job related, consistent with the classification specification, and non-discriminatory. It is not appropriate for department hiring managers to apply different or additional screening criteria to narrow down the referred applicant pool; these discussions

should occur at the Position Evaluation so the criteria may be evaluated by Human Resources staff. Implementing the practice recommended by the auditors may jeopardize the County's Approved Local Merit System status and could subject the County to complaints of discrimination.

Finding 3: Untimely verification of resumes in Job Match

Candidates apply for open positions with the county by either submitting resumes via Job Match or by emailing resumes directly to service team recruiters, dependent on the specific requirements stated in the supplemental information of the job posting. Upon submittal in Job Match, resumes are verified by HR Talent Management team members to ensure Job Match converts the resumes into electronic text files accurately. Data provided by HR indicated the number of resumes waiting to be verified averaged 9,377 monthly and ranged from a low of 1,933 to a high of 16,106. On average, the age of resumes waiting for verifications is two to three weeks. This backlog of resumes of awaiting verification is due to staffing issues as a result of recent budget cuts. To lessen the backlog, service team recruiters have set up dedicated email addresses to receive resumes directly for specific recruitments.

When job postings close and recruiters begin to perform resume searches in the Job Match System, it is possible the resume population the recruiters are searching from is incomplete, since there may be approximately 9,377 unverified resumes still in the queue waiting for verification. Consequently, candidates who apply for specific positions might not be evaluated and considered due to untimely verification of resumes in the Job Match System. This negates the county's merit base policy to select the best candidate for the job so that the county can maintain a quality workforce.

Management position concerning the finding: Concur

Comments:

The Human Resources Department concurs with the finding that resume verification has been untimely at times. Budget cuts and staffing shortages have impacted the HR Department's ability to staff dedicated personnel to assign to resume verification. Starting in 2008, staff who formerly performed that function on a dedicated basis were laid off. Currently, staff who are assigned other duties also assist with performing resume verification as time permits. Without having dedicated personnel to perform this function, it has been difficult to maintain efforts to keep up on incoming volume. As funding allows, the HR Department does employ temporary staff to respond to spikes in incoming resume volume, but does not have funding to support dedicated full-time staff to respond to resume verification.

Recommendation 3:

April 15, 2013

Page 10 of 10

The department is currently in the process of implementing a new recruiting software system to improve the efficiency of resume verification. We recommend the new software system be thoroughly analyzed to ensure circumstances as noted above do not occur in the new system.

Management position concerning the recommendation: Concur

Comments:

The Human Resources department concurs that it is desirable to implement new recruiting software to eliminate the need for resume verification. The HR Department and Riverside County Information Technology (RCIT) are currently working to implement new applicant tracking software utilizing the County's Human Resources Management System (HRMS), PeopleSoft. The new PeopleSoft module related to recruiting will eliminate the need for resume verification because applicants confirm their own application data. Many other enhancements and efficiencies to the recruiting process will be afforded by the new system such as the use of an electronic CRF process, use of workflows, and provisioning managers access to electronic applicant records. The use of PeopleSoft's recruiting module will be rolled out on a phase-in basis, with the Probation Department anticipated to be the first adopting department. This will help to reduce incoming resume volume because the Deputy Probation Officer recruitment, a commonly hired position in the Probation Department, can generate a high volume of applicants when recruitments are being conducted. Resume verification will still need to be performed until all departments have transitioned to the new recruiting system software; however, as more departments become users of the new PeopleSoft recruiting system, volume of incoming resumes to JobMatch will decrease.