

**SUBMITTAL TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS  
COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA**



**ITEM: 12.1**  
**(ID # 24832)**

**MEETING DATE:**  
Tuesday, May 21, 2024

**FROM :** DEPARTMENT OF WASTE RESOURCES:

**SUBJECT:** DEPARTMENT OF WASTE RESOURCES: El Sobrante Landfill Citizens Oversight Committee (COC) 2023 Annual Report, District 2. [\$0]

**RECOMMENDED MOTION:** That the Board of Supervisors:

1. Receive and file the 2023 Annual Report of the El Sobrante Landfill COC.

**ACTION:Policy**

Hans Kelkamp, General Manager - Chief Engineer 4/22/2024

---

**MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS**

On motion of Supervisor Gutierrez, seconded by Supervisor Jeffries and duly carried by unanimous vote, IT WAS ORDERED that the above matter is approved as recommended.

Ayes: Jeffries, Spiegel, Washington, Perez and Gutierrez  
Nays: None  
Absent: None  
Date: May 21, 2024  
xc: Waste

Kimberly A. Rector  
Clerk of the Board  
By:   
Deputy

**SUBMITTAL TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE,  
STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

<b>FINANCIAL DATA</b>	<b>Current Fiscal Year:</b>	<b>Next Fiscal Year:</b>	<b>Total Cost:</b>	<b>Ongoing Cost</b>
<b>COST</b>	\$ 0	\$ 0	\$ 0	\$ 0
<b>NET COUNTY COST</b>	\$ 0	\$ 0	\$ 0	\$ 0
<b>SOURCE OF FUNDS:</b> Waste Resources Enterprise Fund			<b>Budget Adjustment:</b>	No
			<b>For Fiscal Year:</b>	23/24

**C.E.O. RECOMMENDATION:** Approve

**BACKGROUND:**

**Summary**

In accordance with Resolution No. 2005-148 Adopting Uniform Rules and Procedures for Advisory Committees, Board and Commissions of the County of Riverside and Board Policy A-21, advisory groups to the Board are required to file an annual report of their activities. The 2023 Annual Report of the El Sobrante Landfill COC, which includes the meeting minutes for the 2023 reporting year, is attached.

**Impact on Residents and Businesses**

The motion to receive and file the 2023 El Sobrante Landfill COC Annual Report will not result in impacts to citizens or businesses.

**ATTACHMENT:**

**Attachment A. 2023 El Sobrante Landfill COC Annual Report**

  
Jason Farin, Principal Management Analyst 5/14/2024

  
Aaron Gettis, Chief of Deputy County Counsel 4/24/2024

**RIVERSIDE COUNTY  
EL SOBRANTE LANDFILL CITIZENS OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE**

**2023 ANNUAL REPORT**

**MEETINGS:**

In 2023, the El Sobrante Landfill Citizens Oversight Committee (COC) met in February, August, and November. COC activities are summarized below, with the meeting minutes attached.

**ACTIVITIES:**

**February 2, 2023**

1. The Riverside County Transportation Department provided updates on the Incinerator Ash Funding Balance and Temescal Canyon Road Improvements.
2. Department of Waste Resources (RCDWR) provided updates on the Local Mitigation Trust Fund and illegal dumping signage.
3. Local Enforcement Agency (LEA) provided details regarding monthly inspections of the landfill.
4. Waste Management Inc. (WM) provided landfill operation updates.

**August 2, 2023**

1. RCDWR provided updates on the Local Mitigation Trust Fund, presented information about the proposed Renewable Natural Gas (RNG) facility, and illegal dumping signage.
2. LEA provided landfill inspections that lead to a violation and area of concern which were both resolved.
3. WM provided landfill operation updates.
4. COC members elected a new Chair (Jerry Sincich) and Vice-Chair (Tracy Davis). The 2022 Annual Report was discussed, along with the proposed RNG facility.

**November 8, 2023**

1. RCDWR provided updates on the proposed RNG facility and the Local Mitigation Trust Fund.
2. LEA provided landfill inspection and odor investigation updates.
3. WM provided landfill operation updates.
4. COC provided comments on the Final 2022 El Sobrante Annual Report.

<b>COC Members</b>	<b>Representing</b>	<b>February 2, 2023</b>	<b>August 2, 2023</b>	<b>November 8, 2023</b>	<b>Term Ends</b>
Fred Myers	2 <sup>nd</sup> District	✓	✓	✓	6/30/25
Ruth Brissenden	2 <sup>nd</sup> District	✓	✓	✓	6/30/25
Jerry Sincich	2 <sup>nd</sup> District	✓	✓	✓	6/30/25
Lee Wilson	2 <sup>nd</sup> District	✓	✓	✓	6/30/25
Tracy Davis	2 <sup>nd</sup> District	✓		✓	6/30/25
<b>County Staff</b>					
Aaron Gettis	County Counsel	✓	✓	✓	
Andy Cortez	RCDWR	✓			
Ryan Ross	RCDWR	✓	✓	✓	
Mariela Aguilar	RCDWR		✓	✓	
Misty Randall	RCDWR	✓			
Kinika Hesterly	RCDWR	✓	✓	✓	
Sandi Salas	Environmental Health	✓	✓	✓	
Kristine Kim	Environmental Health	✓		✓	
Fritz Devera	Environmental Health		✓	✓	
Kathy Wampler	Transportation	✓			
Melania Castellanos	BOS 2 <sup>nd</sup> District	✓	✓		
<b>WMI Staff</b>					
David Meyer	WM	✓	✓	✓	
Linda Lockhart	WM	✓	✓	✓	
Cindy Daverin	WM	✓		✓	
Art Marquez	WM	✓	✓		
Jayna Morgan	WM	✓			
Richard Carpenter	WM		✓	✓	
Miriam Cardenas	WM			✓	
Scott Tignac	WM			✓	

✓ = Attended

**February 2, 2023  
Meeting Minutes**

**EL SOBRANTE LANDFILL  
CITIZENS OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE  
MINUTES**

**February 02, 2023**

The following were present:

**Committee Members**

Ruth Brissenden  
Tracy Davis  
Lee Wilson  
Fred Myers  
Jerry Sincich

**Committee Members Absent**

**WMI/USA Waste**

David Meyer, El Sobrante Landfill  
Art Marquez, El Sobrante Landfill  
Linda Lockhart, El Sobrante Landfill  
Jayna Morgan, El Sobrante Landfill  
Cindy Daverin, Mariposa Biology

**Guests/Interested Parties**

Jannlee Watson  
Keith Boyle  
Mary Genny Tyler

**County Staff**

Aaron Gettis  
Andy Cortez  
Ryan Ross  
Kinika Hesterly  
Misty Randall  
Sandi Salas  
Kristine Kim  
Kathy Wampler  
Melania Castellanos

**Representing**

County Counsel  
Waste Resources  
Waste Resources  
Waste Resources  
Waste Resources  
Environmental Health  
Environmental Health  
Transportation Dept.  
BOS Second District

**1. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS**

The meeting was called to order at 10:10 a.m. by Vice-Chairperson Ruth Brissenden.

**2. APPROVAL OF OCTOBER 06, 2022, MEETING MINUTES**

Tracy Davis motioned to approve the minutes as written, Jerry Sincich seconded the motion.  
Approved as written by a 4-0 vote (Lee Wilson absent for vote)

**3. DISCUSSION ITEMS**

**A. Staff Update**

**1. Incinerator Ash Funding Balance**

Kathy Wampler (TLMA Transportation) reported:

- \$2,407,578 Total Ash Fees collected as of 12/31/2022, beginning FY2014/2015 through FY2022/2023 bringing in on average \$220,000 in revenue per year.
- Transportation spent \$2,086,759 of ash funds, with a remaining balance of \$320,819.

- Ryan Ross and the COC discussed the long-term outlook for incinerator ash funding and the issues surrounding the Southeast Resource Recovery Facility (SERRF) in Long Beach.

## 2. Temescal Canyon Road (TCR) Improvements

Kathy Wampler reported on completed and future projects along TCR.

## B. Landfill Update

### 1. General Site Operations

David Meyer reports on general site operations:

- Currently filling in 13A, lift 5.
- Lower tonnage volume has been received due to weather from December through January.
- No violations from LEA in the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter. No other inspections in that time.
- Odor neutralizing system running 24/7.

Jayna Morgan reported:

- LEA approved the Chip and Grind Facility in June of 2022.
- Designing the electrical system to power the operation. The plan is to have an interim pad for dumping green waste and utilizing transfer trucks to haul out the organic material.

COC discussed odors, processing, and logistics of the operation.

### 2. Supplemental Irrigation- Outside Landfill Slopes

David Meyer reported:

- Parts have all been ordered, with some on back order. Current estimated installation date is February 6, 2023.

COC discussed installation, costs, location, and seed mix, for the irrigation system and hydroseed.

### 3. Overview of Odor Control System

David Meyer reported:

- The Odor Control System is currently running 24/7.

COC discussed expansion of the system in response to landfill growth.

## C. Local Enforcement Agency Update

### 1. Site Inspections

Sandi Salas reported:

- One area of concern was noted in December of 2022 in regard to the tarp utilized in the daily cover. This concern was addressed and there are no outstanding areas of concern.

COC discussed items covered during LEA inspections.

### 2. Odor Complaints

COC and Sandi Salas discussed odor complaints and reporting processes.

Sandi Salas provided the following link to report odors:

<https://www.rivcoeh.org/Contactus/Complaint>, selecting *Solid Waste Collection* and noting *El Sobrante Landfill*.

## **D. Local Mitigation Trust Fund**

### **1. Illegal Dumping Signage**

Ryan Ross reported:

- In December 2022, the Board of Supervisors approved the COC's funding request for illegal dumping signage. Parts and supplies have been ordered. Once the installation is complete, the COC will be notified.

### **4. PUBLIC COMMENTS (Individuals desiring to speak to the Citizens Oversight Committee will be limited to a maximum of three minutes)**

Public Commentors: Jannlee Watson, Keith Boyle.

- Jannlee addressed COC appointments, opportunities for public comment, and additional COC meetings.
- Keith Boyle addressed odors.

### **5. COMMENTS FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

Fred Myers showed concern regarding frequency of inspection of incineration ashes brought to landfill. Encourages more community outreach from WMI for purposes of education and outreach.

Tracy Davis agreed with encouragement for more community outreach, recommends Temescal Canyon Fair for outreach event.

Lee Wilson discussed meeting quarterly.

### **6. NEXT MEETING DATE**

Tentatively scheduling for April 2023.

### **7. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 12:40 PM

RR:MR



**August 2, 2023  
Meeting Minutes**

**EL SOBRANTE LANDFILL  
CITIZENS OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE  
MINUTES**

**August 02, 2023**

The following were present:

**Committee Members**

Lee Wilson, Chair  
Ruth Brissenden, Vice-Chair  
Fred Myers  
Jerry Sincich

**Committee Members Absent**

Tracy Davis

**WMI/USA Waste**

David Meyer, El Sobrante Landfill  
Art Marquez, El Sobrante Landfill  
Linda Lockhart, El Sobrante Landfill  
Richard Carpenter, El Sobrante Landfill

**County Staff**

Aaron Gettis  
Ryan Ross  
Mariela Aguilar  
Kinika Hesterly  
Sandi Salas  
Fritzy Devera  
Melania Castellanos

**Representing**

County Counsel  
Waste Resources  
Waste Resources  
Waste Resources  
Environmental Health  
Environmental Health  
BOS 2<sup>nd</sup> District

**Guests/Interested Parties**

John Watson	WeAreTV
Jannlee Watson	WeAreTV
Mike Everton	Toro Energy
Randy Glad	Toro Energy
Jason Rolfsness	Third Gen Civil Engineering
Jim Bolton	Resident
Sherry Donahue	Resident
John Donahue	Resident
Larry Corder	Resident
Dave Davis	Resident
Martin Lange	Resident

**I. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS**

The meeting was called to order at 10:03 a.m. by Lee Wilson.

**II. APPROVAL OF FEBRUARY 2, 2023, MEETING MINUTES**

Jerry Sincich motioned to approve the minutes as written, Ruth Brissenden seconded the motion. Approved as written by a 4-0 vote.

**III. DISCUSSION ITEMS**

**A. STAFF UPDATES**

**1. Renewal Natural Gas (RNG) Facility**

Ryan Ross, RCDWR reported:

- This item is being presented to the COC for information only. WM and Toro Energy, LLC. (Toro) entered into an agreement for Toro to install and operate an RNG Facility onsite. The

RNG Facility will process LFG that will be diverted from the existing flares, processed to meet SoCal Gas specifications, and sold to SoCal Gas.

- The RNG facility was environmentally evaluated by the County (technical reports and visual analysis) and found to be exempt from CEQA. Staff as well as County Counsel reviewed the RNG project, and per the Landfill Agreement, the proposed RNG facility was subject to Administrative Review Committee (ARC) approval.
- The (ARC) met on July 12<sup>th</sup> and approved the RNG facility. The ARC found that the facility is consistent with the development of the site project plan which was approved by the Board of Supervisors in 1998.
- Next step for the RNG project is developing final construction and design plans for submittal to the County for plan check, with an expected operational date of Spring 2025.

Toro (Randy Glad/Michael Evertson) and Jason Rolfsness (Third Gen Engineering) provided details on the RNG facility discussing the process and locations for the facility, as well as reviewed project exhibits and visual simulations.

- The COC questioned the County's approval process, as well as environmental review, for the RNG facility. The COC, staff, Toro, County Counsel (Aaron Gettis), and public attendees discussed the RNG facility, including, but not limited to the following items:
  - Facility aesthetics, staffing, safety/security, inspection frequency, permitting, capital costs, odors, construction schedule, environmental studies and analysis, approval/review process, lack of public participation, use of the bridge, pipeline safety, landfill gas collection system, and condensate disposal (sewer to Temescal Valley Water District). Written questions/topics from Fred Myers and Tracy Davis, as discussed during the meeting, are attached to these minutes.
  - Staff will provide updates to the COC as the RNG project progresses and coordinate meetings with COC members and Toro as necessary.

## **B. LOCAL MITIGATION TRUST FUND**

Ryan Ross reported:

- approximately \$72,000 remains in the trust fund and illegal dumping signs, authorized by the COC in October 2022, have been successfully installed.

## **C. LANDFILL UPDATES**

### **1. General Site Operations**

David Meyer reported:

- The landfill is becoming more visible as Phase 13 is filled. Filling in Phase 13 is expected to continue through summer of 2024.
- The landfill is receiving approximately 65,000 tons per week of trash.
- Richard Carpenter is the new community relations representative for the landfill.

### **2. Supplemental Irrigation for Outside Slopes**

David Meyer reported:.

- The irrigation system was relocated to the top slopes. The outside slopes were seeded in December 2022.
- Due to above average rainfall, supplemental irrigation was not needed in 2022/23.

### **3. Odor Control**

David Meyer reported:

- A second line was added to the odor control system, approximately 5 feet taller than the existing line. The odor control misting lines were expanded by 2,300 feet, and a portable misting unit is being used closer to the active landfill area.
- Fred Myers and Dave Meyer discussed leachate/condensate recirculation and storage, as well as sub-surface/surface cracks.

## **D. LOCAL ENFORCEMENT AGENCY UPDATE**

### **1. Site Inspection**

Update from Sandi Salas

- In April 2023, one violation was noted when the landfill exceeded the weekly tonnage limit by 3.58 tons. This incident prompted the implementation of systems to prevent tonnage from approaching such levels. The issue has since been resolved, and there have been no further violations.
- An Area of Concern was identified during the May inspection for insufficient daily cover. Exposed waste was noted at the edge of the tarps and there were holes/tears in the tarps. The issues were resolved.

### **2. Odor complaints**

Update from Sandi Salas

- Over the past couple of months (May-June), Environmental Health (DEH) received approximately 50 odor complaints, primarily from the Terramor community. DEH addressed each complaint, conducted inspections and ensured that the landfill odor mitigations were being met.
- In July 2023, there was a notable improvement, with only one odor complaint received.

## **IV. ACTION ITEMS**

### **A. Chair and Vice Elections**

Lee Wilson nominated Jerry Sincich as Chair, and Tracy Davis as Vice Chair. Ruth Brissenden seconded the motion. Motion passed 4-0.

### **B. Introduction of 2022 El Sobrante Annual Report**

- COC members discussed the Annual Report and the written comments prepared by Tracy Davis (read by Fred Myers).

## **V. PUBLIC COMMENTS (Individuals desiring to speak to the Citizens Oversight Committee will be limited to a maximum of three minutes)**

Public Commentors: Jannlee Watson, Martin Lange, John Watson

- Jannlee acknowledged and thanked WM for their contributions and outreach for community events.
- Martin Lange discussed the POR site (along Dawson Canyon Road) for the RNG facility.
- John Watson suggested that the RNG project be presented at the TVMAC.

**VI. COMMENT FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

Fred Myers asked when the COC could expect responses to his questions regarding CEQA, approval process, and amending landfill agreement, related to the RNG facility. Ryan Ross stated that staff will meet with County Counsel to review COC questions and prepare responses.

**VII. NEXT MEETING DATE**

The next meeting is scheduled for November 8, 2023, 10:00am.

**VIII. ADJOURNMENT**

Meeting adjourned at 1:34 pm

RR:MA

**November 8, 2023**  
**Meeting Minutes**

**EL SOBRANTE LANDFILL CITIZENS  
OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE  
MINUTES**

**November 8, 2023**

The following were present:

**Committee Members**

Jerry Sincich, Chair  
Tracy Davis, Vice Chair  
Lee Wilson  
Ruth Brissenden  
Fred Myers

**Committee Members Absent**

**WMI/USA Waste**

David Meyer, El Sobrante Landfill  
Linda Lockhart, El Sobrante Landfill  
Richard Carpenter, El Sobrante Landfill  
Cindy Daverin, El Sobrante Landfill  
Scott Tignac, El Sobrante Landfill  
Miriam Cardenas, El Sobrante Landfill

**County Staff**

Aaron Gettis  
Ryan Ross  
Mariela Aguilar  
Kinika Hesterly  
Sandi Salas  
Fritzy Devera  
Kristine Kim

**Representing**

County Counsel  
Waste Resources  
Waste Resources  
Waste Resources  
Environmental Health  
Environmental Health  
Environmental Health

**Guests/Interested Parties**

Jannlee Watson      WeAreTV  
Jim Bolton            Resident  
Martin Labombarda   Resident

**I. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS**

The meeting was called to order at 10:01a.m. by Jerry Sincich.

**II. APPROVAL OF AUGUST 2, 2023, MEETING MINUTES**

Fred Myers motioned to approve the minutes as written, Lee Wilson seconded the motion. Approved as written by a 5-0 vote.

**III. DISCUSSION ITEMS**

Jerry discussed reordering the agenda to address complaints upfront, allowing community members interested in the discussion to participate. Fred made the motion in support, Lee seconded. Passed 5-0.

**A. STAFF UPDATES**

**1. Renewable Natural Gas Facility**

Ryan Ross reported:

- County staff reevaluated the project and requested that Toro prepare a new CEQA analysis. Additionally, the RNG Project will be provided to the Board of Supervisors for consideration when appropriate. The COC will have an opportunity to review the new analysis prior to Board consideration.

COC members discussed:

- Concerns with the previous processing and CEQA analysis of the project.
- The COC was supportive of the decision for a new CEQA analysis and Board consideration.
- The COC requested clarification on the Joint Technical Document (JTD) modification process. Ryan Ross commented that the item will be included under the LEA update at the next meeting.

## **B. LOCAL MITIGATION TRUST FUND**

Ryan Ross reported:

- Remaining fund balance: \$72,000.

COC members and the public discussed:

- Community clean-ups and the need for the County and WM to both continue and increase support of these efforts throughout the Temescal Valley.

## **C. LANDFILL UPDATES**

### **1. General Site Operations**

David Meyer and Richard Carpenter reported:

- The landfill is currently filling in Phase 13A. The landfill will become more visible once Phase 13 is filled and operations are on the top deck.
- The landfill is receiving approximately 62,000 tons of trash per week.
- Community tours of the landfill are resuming, WM is attending/sponsoring more community events.
- Non-hazardous cement treated incinerator ash is still being delivered to the landfill and used as alternative daily cover (ADC). If this ceases, soil or other options are available to use for ADC.
  - The COC and public commented on potentially using fees from the RNG project to replace the loss of incinerator ash fees, which provide funding for road repairs and improvements in Temescal Valley.

### **2. Supplemental Irrigation for Outside Slopes/Annual Report**

Cindy Daverin and the COC discussed:

- The irrigation system, seeding, fertilizing, and plant growth on the outside slopes.
- Due to above average rainfall, supplemental irrigation was not needed in 2022/23. If annual rainfall is less than 12 inches, supplemental irrigation will be used (only during the rainy season). WM monitors rainfall during the rainy season and the goal is 3 inches of water per month (either natural rainfall or irrigation).
- Plant species, seed mixes, bulbs, and native plants.

### **3. Leachate use/AQMD Annual Emission Report & Fees**

Dave Meyer, the COC, and the public discussed:

- Current and future use of leachate, best management practices for leachate use/control, and the purpose of the AQMD emission reports and fees.

### **4. Roll-off bins/litter control**

Richard Carpenter, COC members, and the public discussed:

- Roll-off bins for Dawson Canyon and Spanish Hills. Bins are provided monthly.
- WM sponsors the clean-up of I-15 through Caltrans and monitors Temescal Canyon Road for litter.

### **5. Odor Control**

Richard Carpenter reported:

- A significant decrease in odor complaints since 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter.
- Complaints were conveyed through email and text messages. He actively engages by conducting on-site walkthroughs in Terramor to experience the odor situation firsthand.
- He conducts morning odor inspections daily, collecting the data to track any issues.

COC members addressed:



- The need to track and compile wind speed/direction, weather data, active disposal location, and other relevant information, when addressing odor complaints.
  - Richard reported WM does track this data and is compiling the information.
- The LEA odor complaint processing and requested that the LEA notify WM when they receive an odor complaint so WM can take immediate action to correct/investigate, rather than waiting for the LEA to investigate the matter 24-48 hours later.
  - Sandi Salas committed to notifying WM when the LEA receives odor complaints.

## **D. LOCAL ENFORCEMENT AGENCY UPDATE**

### **1. Site Inspection**

Update from Sandi Salas

- The LEA conducts monthly inspections at the landfill, and for the last quarter, no violations were noted. There were four (4) odor complaints addressed to the LEA during this period.

The COC and public addressed:

- The difficulty of submitting odor complaints to several different agencies.
- Questioned if there was a better way to consolidate the complaint procedure so that residents don't need to file multiple complaints with different agencies. Suggested having one complaint submittal location on WM's website that would notify applicable agencies.
  - Richard Carpenter committed to reviewing this request with his IT team.

## **IV. ACTION ITEMS**

### **A. Comments on Final 2022 El Sobrante Annual Report**

- Ruth Brissenden questioned missing details in the appendices.
  - Ryan Ross committed to addressing the omitted technical data.

## **V. PUBLIC COMMENTS (Individuals desiring to speak to the Citizens Oversight Committee will be limited to a maximum of three minutes)**

Public Commentors: Jannlee Watson, Martin Labombarda

- **Jannlee Watson** raised concerns about the bridge inspection reports and responsibility of maintenance/repairs to the bridge. Suggestions: Include annual bridge inspection in the landfill Annual Report, post the report on the County's website.
- **Martin Labombarda** inquired about the number of concerned residents present versus staff/WM representatives.

## **VI. COMMENT FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

- **Lee Wilson** inquired about the bridge inspections. Dave Meyer stated the bridge is inspected by a 3rd party, qualified structural engineer. The reports will be reviewed by WM then released to the County for posting on their public website.
- **Jerry Sincich** thanked County staff and WM for addressing questions and providing information and data to the COC.

## **VII. NEXT MEETING DATE**

The next meeting is scheduled for March 13, 2024, 10:00am.

## **VIII. ADJOURNMENT**

Meeting adjourned at 12:11 pm.